نظرية المعرفة المقارنة البنيوية للتجربة الدينية والحدس الصوفي في التصوف الإسلامي

عمو رضائي ، فرهاد (الكاتب الموثول) عضو هيئة التدريس بجامعة إيلام ، إيران

Structural comparison epistemology of religious experience and mystical intuition in Islamic mysticism

(Amoo Rezaei , Farhad)Corresponding Author Faculty Member of Ilam University , Ilam , Iran f.amoorezaei@ilam.ac.ir

إن الخبرة الدينية والحدس الصوفي ليسا متساويين ولا مرادفين ، ومن ناحية أخرى ، لا يوجد تناقض بينهما على الإطلاق. فيما يتعلق بالهيكل والدساتير ، لديهما عناصر مشتركة ومختلفة. أن تكون جوهريًا هو أحد العناصر المشتركة للتجربة والحدس ، وبالتالي ، فإن القلب هـ وأحـد العناصر المشـتركة بينهمًا. إن عملية الاستقبال عن ظهر قلب هي التي يجب على الشخص أن يصرف انتباهه عن الخارج ويخرج من الإهمال والتركيز الكامل على الله حتى يتمكن من الوصول إلى مرحلة الهلاك والحضور. ومن ثم ، فإن إزالة الإهمال ، ومراعاة الله ، ومرحلة الهلاك والحضور هي عناصر مشتركة للتجربة والحدس . في هذه الحالة ، يتقبل قلب الإنسان الأضواء الإلهية ويتمكن الشخص من الوصول إلى الأمور غير المرئية التي كانت تخفيه ذات يوم. بالنظر إلى هذا الاتجاه معًا ، يمكن استنتاج أن الأضواء الإلهية والأسرار غير المرئية هي دساتير أساسية للتجربة الدينية والجدس الصوفي . وتستند العناصر المتمايزة للتجربة والحدس إلى حقيقة أنهما ضروريان للمعاناة من التقشف والمحاولة. ومع ذلك ، ففي اكتساب الخبرة الدينية ، فإن مثل هذه المسألة ليست ضرورية. لكنها تتحقق بدون مثل هذه المقدمات. لذلك ، لا يتم بلوغ الحدس بسرعة. لكن الأمر يستغرق وقتا ويتطلب معاناة تقشف من قبل الصوفى. هؤلاء هم الأشخاص المناسبون الذين اتخذوا خطوات في طريق التصوف. لكن الحدس الصوفى ليس قضية شاملة لكن التجربة الدينية شاملة وتشمل أولئك الذين ليس لديهم دين. لهذا السبب، يتفوق الحدس الصوفي على التجربة الدينية ويتمتع بمكانة بارزة في المعتقد العام. الكلمات المفتاحية : التجربة الدينية ، الحدس الصوفي ، القلب ، الحجاب ، الإدراك

Abstract الستخلص

Religious experience and mystical intuition are neither equal, nor synonym and on the other hand, they are not contradictory at all. With respect to structure and constitutions, they have common and different elements. Being intrinsic is one of the common elements of the experience and intuition and consequently, one of the common elements of them is heart. Process of reception by heart is such that someone must detract his attention from outside and get out of negligence and completely concentrate on god so that he can achieve the stage of perdition and presence. Hence, removal of negligence, attending god, stage of perdition and presence are common elements of experience and intuition. In this case, human heart accepts divine lights and person gets access to unseen affairs which were once covert to him. Taken this trend together, it can be concluded that divine lights and unseen secrets are essential constitutions of religious experience and mystical intuition. Differentiated elements of experience and intuition are based on the fact that they are necessity of suffering austerity and attempt. However, in attaining religious experience, such an issue is not necessary. But it is achieved without such preliminaries. Therefore, intuition is not attained rapidly. But it takes time and requires suffering austerities by the mystic. These are right people who took steps in the way of mysticism. But, mystical intuition is not a comprehensive issue but religious experience is comprehensive and includes those having no religion. For this reason, mystical intuition is superior over experience and has religious an outstanding position in public belief.

Key words : religious experience , mystical intuition, heart, veil, cognition

Adab Al-Kufa Journal No. 49 / P2 Muharram 1443 / Sep 2021 ISSN Print 1994 - 8999 ISSN Online 2664-469X

مجلة آداب الكوفة العدد ٢٩٠ ج٢ محرم ١٤٤٣ هـ / ايلول ٢٠٢١م

Problem statement

Religious experience is an expression spread by western scholars by second half of 19th century and mystics used expressions relevant to it such as apocalypse, examination and observation. Many use these concepts as equivalent to religious experience, but the performance and structural difference demands systematic study. Despite of various studies performed in the field of religious experience and mystical intuition, no certain research has been carried out on the structural comparison of them. Expression of the differences and similarities requires comparative study. We mean by comparative study the recognition of religious experience and mystical intuition in the light of explanation of difference and similarity of them (Gharamaleki, 2006: 294).

Religious experience and mystical intuition can be compared from at least two aspects: structural and factual comparison as well as performance and ultimate comparison. In this paper, it is attempted to determine whether what is called Religious experience in west is different from what is called observation by Muslim mystics from conceptual point of view. Are they common in one issue or unit nature? Are they similar conceptual and factual items so that they can be considered as exact synonyms? According to problem stated above, it is necessary to analyze various viewpoints in definition and interpretation of them. In this paper, first, definition and explanation and then, interpretation of the nature are reported and analyzed from western scholars and Muslim mystics' point of view.

Religious experience

Analysis of religious experience can be performed in two stages: expression of meaning and interpretation of the nature.

Semantics of religious experience

Religious experience can be explained through its analysis in experience and religious components. Term "experience" comes in various forms. This term is known by Persians as testing and evaluation (Dehkhoda, 19956: 1/378). Term experience in scripture means mainly perpetration of a sin and becoming brave for doing it (Luke Bile, 18-22: 4/13). Term al-jarab means disease and al-jabbat means a group of people who eat and have no benefits. Al-jarbat means a qualified land for farming.

Adab Al-Kufa Journal ISSN Print 1994 - 8999 مجلة آذاب الكوفة العدد 18 / 22 No. 49 / P2 العدد 18 / 24 Muharram 1443 / Sep 2021 ISSN Online 2664-469X محرم 1437 محرم 1437 م

Experience is one of the events occurring in the spirits and its owner is aware of it (Davis, 1989: 19-22). Similarly, experience is an event which passes by someone who is aware of it (Paterson et.al, 1997: 36). Human uses experience as one of the methods of getting cognition in various fields of science such as natural sciences, skill experiences of industries and guilds, artistic customs of artists and daily life.

The term experience was first used for investigation of materialistic issues and natural phenomena as was never used in metaphysical and religious issues such as god, angles, as son. This meaning of experience is its traditional application (Ghaemi Nia, 2002, a: 22). By the appearance of moodrn era in west and revolution of cognition tools, reason was replaced by experience and many western scohlars attempted to investigate metaphysical issues through it. This led to different meanings of experience (Sobhani, 1996: 111). In moodrn era, experience is called something which occurs for us not those we do.

These are the experience of internal moods which are added to my internal memories. These are something which I feel or observe, pains I suffer and internal reactions and emotions. For instance, if burning occurs for someone, an internal mood is created within him/her which is the feeling of burning (Ghaemi Nia, same, a: 22-23, Faali, 1999: 340). Therefore, we mean by experience the extant. "the way objects appear for vision, hearing or touch of someone at the time of having the experience. (Miles, 2001: 36)". Experience in recent applications have characteristics of live reception, being specific, sense of sympathy, independence of concepts, mental reasoning and being non-transferable(Ghaemi Nia, same, a: 49-50). Experience is hierarchical and doubted as well.

The origin of the revolution in application of the term experience is the change of human vision toward life. Before 17th century, human considered life as a chain of prestigious actions. However, moodrn human considers it as previous experiences such as sadness, happiness, travels, passions, successes and so on (Same: 47-8). Superficial and toolless experience is traditional experience and equipped, natural sciences, philosophical, mystical and religious experiences are deeper levels of experience.

The aim of the religion – according to Tabatabaei –is a system based on feelings, beliefs and their implementation for guidance of human for the sake of understanding an unknown being and absolute perfection (Tabatabaei, 1996: 21, same, 1996: 8/15). Taking into account the

| Adab Al-Kufa Journal No. 49 / P2 Muharram 1443 / Sep 2021 | ISSN Print 1994 – 8999 ISSN Online 2664-469X | مجلة آداب الكوفة العدد :٤٩ /ج٢ محرم ١٤٤٣ هـ /ايلول ٢٠٢١ |
|---|---|---|
|---|---|---|

religion whose ultimate purpose appears as the main axis, it is understood that considering as religious in the term of religious experience is for two aspects: first, with regard to its belonging which is a metaphysical being and god and manifestations and relevant issues. Second, through description of experience when subject uses religious terms for its description. Therefore. sometimes experiencer attains religious experience although its origin is not religious; because in this experience, religious descriptions are used; such as plowing garden's soil and observation of progress of roots of nearby trees and their dominance over garden flowers which evokes the fact that progress of sins can dominate the human like this (Paterson et.al, same: 37).

Main viewpoints in interpretation of religious experiences

Regarding nature of religious experiences, various viewpoints are presented. Addressing these viewpoints can be useful in illustrating religious experinces (Faali, 2001: 452, Ghaemi Nia, same, a: 36, Paterson et.al, same: 41).

Schleiermacher (1768-1834) believed that religious experience is not a type of mental or cognitive experience; instead, it is a type of feeling or emotion and a passivemood (1928: 17). He considers the religious experience as a complex set of feelings, such as sense of infinity or absolute dependence (Proudfoot, 2004: 92). Religious experience, is a sense of belonging and absolute dependence upon an origin and power which is different from the world (Paterson et.al, same: 41).

Inspired by Schleiermacher's theorem, Otto (1869-1937) considers religious experience in feeling class and summarizes religious feelings in three classes: dependence feeling, fear and delight.

Maybe the feeling of mystery enters like a pleasing breeze and fills the soul with a relaxation arisen from the deepest layers of worship. This can be changed into a more stable mental status which can persist despite of slides with the fear and submission. Maybe it gets out of the deep of the soul and is accompanied with a serious delight and shake leading to a strange ultimate (1967:12).

He approves that human mind can attribute traits such as spirit, restrictiveness, being singular, absolute good and erudite and provide a definition for it. Since all of these traits have a clear definition but human mind cannot recognize deeper levels of god since god nature cannot be described and its holiness must be recognized by an item beyond the mind; that is feeling (Ghaemi Nia, same, a: 37).

| Adab Al-Kufa Journal No. 49 / P2 Muharram 1443 / Sep 2021 | ISSN Print 1994 – 8999 ISSN Online 2664-469X | مجلة آداب الكوفة العدد ٤٩٠ / ج٢ محرم ١٤٤٣ هـ /ايلول ٢٠٢١م |
|---|---|---|
|---|---|---|

William James doesn't consider the fact of religion solely as the definition presented by philosophers. Instead, he looks at it with a wider vision. He considers the fact and inherent concept of religion as the sense of belonging and dependence upon infinity and claims that in religion category, there are two trends: first, religious organizations such as temples, religious rules, speech knowledge and organizational system of church and another one, an internal issues related to human spirit in which human and relationship with god is addressed. This issue is the religious feeling and internal relationship with god. Religious organizations are based on a tradition from which they received feelings. James considers the religion as the effects, feelings and events occurring for each person in lonely world and far from his/her dependences (1993: 1-6).

According to this view about religion, belonged to these feelings and emotions is the unseen world which produces a strong force in human. This issue is accompanied with apocalypse which leads to understanding a meaningful world by taking the presence of god into account and someone may become religious.

James provides a sample of such moods.

God if absolutely real for me. I often talk to him. When I have a problem, he guides me. Sometimes, he puts a way in front of me which is in conflict with my tendencies and wishes (Same: 53).

He introduces religious experiences with ineffability, noetic quality, and transiency and passiveness traits (Proudfoot, same: 63-65).

In explaining religious experience, Stacey addresses three issues of natural principle, cause indifference and exactness of the religious experiences (1937: 186-7). According to natural principle, each phenomenon in this world occurs within the natural framework of causality (Ibid, 242-258). He accepts mystical affairs and religious experiences. However, he believes that appearance of a mystical mood in human soul is the consequence of a natural act and there is no longer an exception for the natural cause principle (1925: 15).

These moods take place under the control of brain, neural network and emotional changes process. Bucke considers cosmic awareness as a nature issue (1912:12). In the 10^{th} chapter of Clues; that is Asrar-al-ayat, Ibn Sina explains the natural principle with the same motivation (1403: 3/395).

| Adab Al-Kufa Journal No. 49 / P2 Muharram 1443 / Sep 2021 | ISSN Print 1994 – 8999 ISSN Online 2664-469X | مجلمّ آداب الكوفمّ العدد : ٤٩ / ج٢ محرم ١٤٤٣ هـ / ايلول ٢٠٢١م |
|---|---|---|
|---|---|---|

According to indifference principle, mystical intuition is a phenomenon which can have various reasons. Sometimes, the reason is a spiritual affair taking place among mystics and sometimes, non-spiritual affairs. If the mystical experiences are the result of same factors, they are in face the same. Therefore, one cannot consider mystical experiences arisen from spiritual affairs as original and holy as the other one which arises from non-spiritual affairs as valueless. Instead, mystical moods and experiences arisen from various factors are not essentially holy (Stace, 1973: 11). Moods produced by mystical experiences are like moods appeared after drug and alcohol abuse and have no validity. Like mystical illumination of Jacob Bommet occurring after staring at a flat and smooth plate (Ibid: 20). Consequence of cause indifference is not suitable for those who achieved mystical worlds after journey and austerity. Therefore, if it is said that moods provided for you after suffering such difficulties can be achieved by a pill, they will be annoved and reject it. At the same time, the principle of cause indifference is inevitable.

We examine by the principle of exactness that whether mystical discoveries and experiences imply to exact existence. In other words, if mystic can prove something from outside world through apocalypse and mystical experience. Many thinkers like Bucke, Brad and James believe in exactness (Ibid: 32). In the issue of exactness, Stace believes in dissociation. If mystical experiences have common traits, it can imply to exactness. However, if there is no common trait among mystical moods, they cannot imply to exactness.

Stace believes that common mystical traits can be achieved through family similarity. Many mental moods are available which are considered as mystical and other moods which are regarded to as non-mystical traits. Heard and observed item are outside mystical experiences since the most important characteristic of mystical trait is being non-tangible (Ibid: 39). Furthermore, moods of happiness, attraction and coexistence are outside mystical phenomena since they are considered as non-dissociable consequences of mystical experiences and are not integrated necessity of them. Stace presents two general list of common traits of introversive and extroversive experiences as follows

a) Characteristics of introversive mysticism:

Adab Al-Kufa Journal No. 49 / P2 Muharram 1443 / Sep 2021 ISSN Print 1994 – 8999 ISSN Online 2664-469X مجلت آداب الكوفت العدد ٤٩: /ج٢ محرم ١٤٤٣ هـ / ايلول ٢٠٢١

- 1. Unifying vision stating that everything is one. Unit in this type of mysticism is perceived by physical senses in majority or majority of creatures.
- 2. Appended understanding of unit with this internal vision that everything is described by presence of creature.
- 3. Sense of exactness
- 4. Sense of happiness, joy and satisfaction
- 5. Considering everything that is received as holy and spiritual
- 6. Being paradoxical
- 7. Impossibility of expressing moods and their instances
- b) Characteristics of extroversive mysticism:
- 1. Unified awareness to which none of the sensible or other experimental contents cannot approach. This is an essential, necessary and canonical characteristic which is followed by other characteristics.
- 2. Being timeless and placeless
- 3. Sense of exactness and being factual
- 4. Sense of holiness, joy, peace, satisfaction and so on
- 5. Considering whatever understood as holy and from god
- 6. Being paradoxical
- 7. Being non-expressible

Common characteristic of all introversive and extroversive moods of mysticism is the experience of unity which in mystics' opinion, is the essence of all mystical moods and core of all experiences. Another consequence is that among all mystical experiences, there is a common core. Stace notes agreement, ability to search, arrangement and sense of exactness as methods of perceiving common characteristics ofmystical experiences.

One of the best methods of proving exactness of mystical experiences is relying upon physical science since most of the mystics' discoveries are like physical sciences which convey them to the reality. Pike considers the reality of religious experience as mystical unity (1992: 21). Initially, human becomes submerged in spiritualism and Jesus life, remains continuously in metaphysical moodand feels that s/he is guided by a force and is drawn toward a dark, deep and relaxing space. Then, the soul of mystic faces the god in the depot of wine as an essence having ability to see, hear and understand. Eventually, mystic finds a sense of happiness in which the soul of human feel ascending. T is even possible that the body can ascend with soul. Therefore, if the sense of happiness

| Adab Al-Kufa Journal No. 49 / P2 Muharram 1443 / Sep 2021 | ISSN Print 1994 – 8999 ISSN Online 2664-469X | مجلة آداب الكوفة العدد :٤٩ / ج٢ محرم ١٤٤٣ هـ / ايلول ٢٠٢١ |
|---|---|---|
|---|---|---|

approaches its extreme, soul finds a direct connection with god. Saint Teresa noted the silence prayer as an extraordinary mood (1924:250).

The result is that experience is one of the methods of achieving cognition and is an inherent and passive phenomenon appearing in its owners who is aware of it. If the issue of experience is a metaphysical issue like god or manifestations or god appears in it as an ultimate fact, such experience is religious.

Studying the viewpoints regarding the nature of religious experiences reveals that pragmatists such as Schleiermacher, Otto, James, Stace and Pike classify the nature of religious experience as feelings, emotions and a type of passive mood. They believe that religious experience is nothing but sense of belonging and dependence upon infinity.

Mystical intuition

Analysis of mystical intuition can be performed in two ways: expression of meaning and interpretation of its identity.

Semantics of mystical intuition

Intuition comes with various meanings in different dictionaries: intuition means presence, seeing and witnessing something (Amid, 1977, 286/13). Moreover, it means become present, see, examine, obvious, presence and opposite of unseen. The word witness is taken from Arabic and it means becoming present, witnesses as well as demanding witness (Moein, 1983: 2098/2, Dehkhoda, same: 35/43).

Concepts of intuition, apocalypse and examination appear in the works of mystics in various forms. Abu Nasr Tousi considers the observation equivalent to certainty. He defined the apocalypse as follows:

Apocalypse means revealing something which is out of perception of human. Hence, for human, that latent affair becomes apparent as if s/he observes it (same: 412).

Kalabazi states that: observation is a type of depreciation and for the depreciator, there is no awareness but at the time of becoming depreciated (1970:256). He believes that observation is equivalent to certainty. Emam Ghashiri considers apocalypse and observation as presence (1995:75). He believes that discovery comes after presence and intuition comes after presence and apocalypse.

Hajviri states that: "observations are heart visits and heart sees the god in public and private." (19957:427) he considers apocalypse as face

| Adab Al-Kufa Journal No. 49 / P2 Muharram 1443 / Sep 2021 | ISSN Print 1994 – 8999 ISSN Online 2664-469X | مجلة آداب الكوفة العدد ٤٩: /ج٢ محرم ١٤٤٢ هـ / ايلول ٢٠٢١ |
|---|---|--|
|---|---|--|

to face examination of god which is accompanied with quandary (same:478).

Khaje Abdullah Ansari defines apocalypse as removal of veil from heart eye and approaching beyond veil through intuition and utilization of unseen secrets (1916:511). He states that observation is the fall of veil and it is beyond apocalypse (same: 515). Heart has an eye which is called vision (same: 523-6).

Ibn Arabi defines observation as follows:

Observation of objects for the sake of unity... as well as witnessing god in objects... as well as fact of certainty undoubtedly and it comes after apocalypse (1966: 515/1).

Mystic knows no independence for objects and considers them solely as a sign of god and observes the manifestation of god in objects. After going through these stages, he approaches the stage of certainty. Ibn Arabi, notes apocalypse in three meanings: visual apocalypse or scientific one, mood surplus and implication (same).

In introduction of Gheysari, removal of veil comeswith the meaning of apocalypse as well as awareness of beyond the veil as expressional meaning. This awareness belongs to unseen meanings and real affairs. Apocalypse is meeting god with heart's eye which is achieved after suffering austerities and going through stages (Ashtiani, 2006: 543).

From the above definitions, it can be inferred that majority of mystics know no difference between observation and apocalypse and consider both of them the same as presence mood. They consider the nature of apocalypse as the removal of dark veils from heart's eye by suffering austerities after whichobservation is achieved and mystic utilizes unseen secrets by heart's eye. Observation is the stage of perdition in which mood mystic approaches certainty level (the last stage of mystical moods) and god existence manifests in his heart and he benefits from unseen knowledge and real cognitions. Speeches of mystics illustrate that observation is more complete than apocalypse and is achieved after it; since in observation mood, there is no veil between creature and god. Examination is observing god with heart's eye as well which is accompanied with manifestation light. In examination mood, mystic finds a cognition by which s/he observes things as they are. Therefore, examination is a type of observation.

Analysis of main viewpoints regarding interpretation of nature of mystical intuition

Adab Al-Kufa Journal ISSN Print 1994 – 8999 مجلة آداب التكوفة . العدد 24: جلام 72 No. 49 / P2 العدد 24: محرم 24: Muharram 1443 / Sep 2021 ISSN Online 2664-469X مرم 2011 محرم 2011 مرجل 2011 م

Structural comparison epistemology...... (679)

Opinions of mystics regarding the nature of mystical intuition are as follows:

1. Abu Nasr Tousi (378 BC)

According to Tousi, intuition is one of the levels of certainty. He believes that intuition is achieved when veil is removed from heart's eye. In this case, mystic approaches presence mood, achieves real light and the stage of god proximity and his eyes become discerning and whatever was hidden to him, becomes apparent. Through austerities, mystic can enter the privacy of god names and traits which is called the stage of discovery. Discovery refers to heart which is obtained upon connection. If the mystic approaches the stage of presence and intuition, his unity improves and his schism decreases. Of course, in his opinion, observation and apocalypse are not essentially different and both of them are of the type of presence and proximity. Finally,intuition is more complete than apocalypse (same). He believes that apocalypse is possible in this world.

2. Abu-Bakr Kalabazi (380 BC)

He doesn't distinguish the observation and apocalypse. He believes that observation leads to perdition. "Observation is the same as perdition and someone who approaches this stage, cannot inform about it." (1970:256) When mystic approaches the stage of god intuition, becomes astonished and seed anything as good and attends nothing else (same: 256, 404). He puts the perdition stage as the axis of observation. In traveling to god, after passing through creation redundancy and dark veils, mystic approaches the perdition in unity. In other words, he considersall of the creatures as mortal and dissolved in god. In the stage of perdition, mystic sees nothing but unity principle. He believes that observation is the same as certainty.

3. Emam Ghashiri (376/386-465)

He defines apocalypse and observation accompanied with session:

Session is the presence of heart. After achieving it, apocalypse is achieved as well which is the same as presence and session is the presence of god. Therefore, when heart gets out of veil, sun of observation is obtained by means of irradiation of god light (1995:75).

When mystic abandons everything but god and only concentrates on god and doesn't neglect, it is as if he sees god although he is not in front of him. If this mood persists, he approaches the level of apocalypse. In this situation, he sees god names and traits and becomes knowledge owner. If this mood becomes permanent, observation occurs and he

| Adab Al-Kufa Journal No. 49 / P2 Muharram 1443 / Sep 2021 | ISSN Print 1994 – 8999 ISSN Online 2664-469X | مجلة آداب الكوفة العدد ٤٩ / ج٢ محرم ١٤٤٢ هـ / ايلول ٢٠٢١ |
|---|---|--|
|---|---|--|

Structural comparison epistemology...... (680)

achieves the level of soul perdition and becomes mortal and indeterminate. Intuition occurs when veil is removes from the heart eye. In this case, sun rises and the heart of the person becomes illuminated with its light and he meets the god. The notion of Ghahsiri is that observation is the same as presence and is the last stage of it.

4. Abul-Hasan Hajviri

Contrary to Tousi, Hajviri distinguishes observation from presence. Instead, he defines it as equivalent to god vision. In his opinion, if mystic takes eye from forbidden affairs and looks beyond the creatures and hugs the face of the beloved, he approaches the stage of intuition and his eye becomes bright by his beauty although he is in this world. He believes that if human becomes astonished in front of god upon examination, he approaches the stage of apocalypse (Same: 478).One of the issues which can be seen in the definition of apocalypse by Hajviri, is the astonishment of mystic during apocalypse; since during this stage, veil is removed from eye of the mystic's heart and he finds out that everything is surrounded by god and he controls all affairs. Here, he confronts an astonishing reality. It seems that everything is witnessing him and know him, but they are not aware of their knowledge.

5. Pir-e- Herat

Contrary to predecessors, Pir-e- Herat put the apocalypse after observation and views both as equivalent. He considers three stages for knowledge: overt, covert and divine knowledge the last of which is an intuitive understanding like visual one and even more clear than it (1916: 141-143). In his opinion, upon divine manifestations, a cognition is achieved which is beyond the knowledge and is related toheart (same: 246-251). Khaje believes that when through attempts, mystic goes through dark veils and approaches beyond the veil and benefits from unseen secrets, mystical apocalypse which is the result of divine manifestation is formed and is called spiritual apocalypse. In this opinion, this apocalypse has three stages the last of which is the constant exactness occurring by inherent manifestation of god. This stage is the mystical intuition and the highest level of discovery occurring upon removal of veils among creature and god; so that mystic dissolves in god.

6. Najm-al-ddin Razi (573-654 BC)

He doesn't discriminate the observation and apocalypse. He considers the mystical intuition as the vision of god with heart's eye.

| Adab Al-Kufa Journal No. 49 / P2 Muharram 1443 / Sep 2021 | ISSN Print 1994 – 8999 ISSN Online 2664-469X | مجلة أداب الكوفة العدد ٢٤٠ / ٢٢ محرم ١٤٤٣ هـ / ايلول ٢٠٢١ |
|---|---|---|
|---|---|---|

Note that if heart's mirror becomes smoothed with the phrase no god but Allah and the rust of nature and darkness of humanistic traits are removed from it - since everything has a polisher and the polisher of heart is the memory of god, it becomes receptor of unseen lights (1973: 229).

7. Mohy-al-ddin Arabi (560-638 BC)

Ibn Arabi believes that god inmates have dedicated knowledge and like prophets, receive their knowledge directly from god. Like other mystics, he believes that the way of obtaining cognition of god is through reasoning and discovery (1966:1/92). However, through discovery, one can find the real cognition toward god (same: 24, 253, 254, 297, Faali, 1999: 66). If the heart becomes free of fitth and becomes pure, divine cognitions which are a gift of the real donor, enter it in a short period. Regarding observation, Ibn Arabi believes that if mystic observes god in objects and becomes dissolved in god, he approaches the stage of certainty which is called observation.

He classifies apocalypse into three classes: scientific, mod and happiness apocalypse (same: 2/496-8). In his opinion, apocalypse is more complete than observation.

8. Seyyed Heydar Amoli

He states that discovery science is specific to mystics of god inmates although there are clues for others. Such knowledge is not acquisitive; but it is dedicated and sometimes it manifests to human either directly or through general mind or spirit. All of the Sophie sciences obtained through mystical apocalypse are spiritual heritage which are substantiated through god or prophets and settle in mystic's heart (1991: 516).Heydar cites the narration stating that "scholars are heirs of prophets" (Koleyni, 2009: 1/32).

9. Imam Khomeini

He defines the observation as the manifestation of god; that is the manifestation of divine unseen knowledge and real cognitions in the heart of mystic. Observation is only possible by journey and getting out the veil of humanity and tearing the curtains of dissociation. In this case, god makes the mystic concentrated on himself and free from others (1998: 58,171).

He believes that mystical intuition has three levels: activity, trait and inherent manifestation (same: 172). He notes some of the applications of mystical intuitions. First, divine cardinal appears in all mirrors of the

| Adab Al-Kufa Journal No. 49 / P2 Muharram 1443 / Sep 2021 | ISSN Print 1994 – 8999 ISSN Online 2664-469X | مجلة أداب الكوفة العدد ٤٩: ٤٢ / ج٢ محرم ١٤٤٢ هـ / ايلول ٢٠٢١ |
|---|---|--|
|---|---|--|

names. This issue cannot be discovered by no one but authorities who achieved the level of intuition and mystical passion (1981: 32). Second, the appearance of exacts depends upon the humanistic exact and only owners of intuition and mystical level have access to it (same: 60).

Comparative study

Now, we compare the religious experience with mystical intuition. So that the benefits and commonalities of each can be found and the reality of them can be discovered.

Commonalities

- 1. Both are inherent: western thinkers consider the nature of religious experience as affairs such as feelings, natural moods, or a direct connection with god which are all inherent matters. On the other hand, Muslimmystics express the reality of mystical intuition with titles such as vision, session, apocalypse and observation which are accompanied with austerity and refinement the soul from filths, avoiding materialistic love, removal of dark veils, getting out of negligence, attending god, mood of connection and perdition and dissolution in god. Aforesaid affairs all occur within the human.
- 2. Both of them have hierarchies. Owner of intuition and experience gets initially out of negligence and turns to god, divine light radiates on him and his eyes become bright by its illumination. In this case, person achieves the state of perdition and dissolution. This stage is the last level of moods as Pike in the issue of silence prayer considered the religious experience same as mystical unity. Moreover, Tousi, Khomeini and other Islamic mystics imply to this issue.
- **3.** Both have constitutions. Austerity and attempts, removal of negligence, heart, veil, divine light, and moods of presence and unity and unseen secrets are constitutions of intuition and religious experience.

Differences

1. Difference in preliminaries and contexts: according to definition of mystics about mystical intuition, essential axes of intuition are austerity, heart refinement, removal of veil from heart and meeting god by which the mood of presence, connection and proximity is experiences and unseen lights radiates to the heart of the mystic; while according to definitions of pragmatists from religious experiences, none of the components of mystical intuition contribute to it. Therefore, mystical intuition is not attainable instantaneously and

| Adab Al-Kufa Journal No. 49 / P2 Muharram 1443 / Sep 2021 | ISSN Print 1994 – 8999 | مجلة آداب الكوفة العدد : ٤٩ / ج٢ محرم ١٤٤٣ هـ / ايلول ٢٠٢١ |
|---|------------------------|--|
|---|------------------------|--|

without required preparations for the mystic. Instead, mystic must learn certain skills under the supervision of master and go through the moods and stages available in practical and theoretical mysticism and find unseen illuminations to approach the level of mystical apocalypse and observationso that he can discover the facts. Hence, mystical intuition is accessible for those who go through certain stages to achieve god benignity. These people are historically recognized personalities and achieved higher levels of faith and piety; while religious experience doesn't have such characteristic. According to the nature of religious experience, each person can have such an experience so that it can include those who have no religion. As a result, religious experience like mystical intuition demands no preliminaries or going through moods and stages.

2. Difference in consolidation and consistency of viewpoints: another difference is the consolidation and consistency of mystic over the nature of mystical intuition and difference in the vision of pragmatists about the nature of religious experience. Definitions provided by pragmatists about the nature of mystical experience are essentially and basically different. While Schleiermacher, Otto and James consider the religious experience same as feelings and emotions, Alston defined it as a sensational experience which is completely apart from feelings and emotions. Stace considers the religious experience the result of natural affairs and neural and physical reactions of someone. Proudfoot believes that experience must be regarded to from experience subject's point of view and it must be considered as the consequence of metaphysical affairs. Pike believes that the origin of religious and mystical experience is achieving a mystical unity. However, vision of mystics about the nature of mystical intuition are aligned and close to each other. Issues such as austerity, refinement, manifestation of divine lights, presence and connection, proximity and perdition, unity and vision are essential issues in mystical intuition which are available in the viewpoint of all mystics. Pike - one of the Christian thinkers - like mystics, believes that austerity and attending god is the way of achieving religious experience and in this regard, he is in agreement with Muslim mystics. However, other western thinkers note other ways which are not present in visions of Muslim mystics.

Adab Al-Kufa Journal No. 49 / P2 Muharram 1443 / Sep 2021 ISSN Print 1994 – 8999 ISSN Online 2664-469X مجلتي آداب الكوفي العدد ٤٩: ٢٦ / ج٢ محرم ١٤٤٣ هـ / ايلول ٢٠٢١

- **3. Difference** in classification criteria and hierarchies: in classification of mystical intuition, mystics take into account various criteria according to which, mystical intuition has found various levels. However, pragmatists have no certain criterion for classification of religious experience and they solely classify it according to the way of achievement and substantiation. In mystical intuition, manifestation of god into mystic is different with regard to intensity, time and survival. Classification of observation into observation of cognition, examination and collection, is performed in accordance with the level of survival and intensity. However, in hierarchy of religious experience, such criterion is not present. Instead, the manifestation of god into the owner of experience or understanding god or ultimate goal is absolute because of experience.
- **4. Difference with regard to holiness:** mystical intuition is of great holiness and validity because of its belonging to god. However, there is no unified belief about the holiness of religious experience. Since the religious experience is provided for achieving existence reality and absolute one, it is totally holy. But, Stace denies the holiness of religious experience as a result of cause indifference principle.

Conclusion

Present work intends to compare the religious experience and mystical intuition. Conceptual analysis of both items is a prelude for factual analysis of both trends. With regard to application, experience is a revolution and with regard to reality, it is hierarchical the deepest level of which is religious experience. Apocalypse, intuition and observation are different concepts of mystic. Observation is the fall of veil (hijab) and manifestation of right in heart which is obtained through attempts and removal of traditions and determinations. Analysis of various viewpoints about the nature of religious experience and mystical intuition reveals that both of them are intrinsic issues and containing depreciation, unity, awareness, avoiding negligence and presence are common components of them. One of the main differences of them is the condition of achieving each of them. Muslim mystics – more or less –talked about description of mystical observation similarly. However, western scholars are not in agreement in describing mystical experience.

| Adab Al-Kufa Journal No. 49 / P2 Muharram 1443 / Sep 2021 | ISSN Print 1994 – 8999 ISSN Online 2664-469X | مجلة آداب الكوفة العدد ٤٩ /ج٢ محرم ١٤٤٣ هـ / ايلول ٢٠٢١م |
|---|---|--|
|---|---|--|

| Structural comparison epistemology | (685 | |
|------------------------------------|------|--|
| | 1003 | |

References

Holy Quran

1. Scripture

- 2. Ibn Sina, 1403, alesharat va tanbihat, Tehran, nashr ketab pub.
- 3. Ibn Arabi, M., 1966, alfotuhan almakkye, Beirut, dar ahya altorath alarab
- 4. _____, 1400, fosus alhekam, Beirut, daralketan alarabi
- 5. Ibn monavvar, M., 1376, asrar altowhid fi maghamat sheikh abu saeid, research of Dr. Kadkani, bija, agah pub.
- 6. Ashtiani, J., 1385, introduction of gheisari on fosus alhekam, Mashhad, bastan
- 7. Amoli, H., jame alasrar va manba alanvar, Qom, alzahra
- 8. Ansari, A., 1295, manazel almosaferin, Tehran, Hamedi library
- 9. Paterson, M., 1997, mind and religious belief, translated by Naraghi, A., Soltani, E., Tehran, tarh no
- Proudfoot, W., 2004, religious experience, translated by Yazdani, A., Qom, Taha pub.
- 11. Jar, K., 1998, Larous dictionary, Tehran, Amirkabir pub.
- 12. James, W., 1993, religious and soul, translated by Ghaeni, M., Tehran, Islamic revolution education and publication
- 13. Khosropanah, A., 2000, new word, Qom, center of studies and cultural researches of Hoze Elmiyeh
- 14. Dehkhoda A., 1956, dehkhoda dictionary, Tehran, Cyrus pub.
- 15. Razi, N., 1973, mersadalebad, corrected by Ryahi, M., Bija, ketab pub.
- 16. Sobhani, J., 1996, new problems in speech science, Qom, Emam Sedegh institution
- 17. Seraj Tousi, A., 2001, Allam', Baghdad, daralkotob alhaditha
- 18. Tabatabaei, M., 1996, Shia in Islam, Qom, center of Islamic publication
- 19. _____, 1997, translation of almizan interpretation, vol. 15, Qom, Islamic publication of Qom teachers society
- 20. Amid, H., 1977, Amid dictionary, Tehran, Amir Kabir pub., 11th ed.
- 21. Gharamaleki, F., 2006, methodology of religious studies, Mashhad, Razavi Islamic sciences university
- 22. Faali, M., 1999, basic sciences, theory of evident, Qom, daralsadeghin
- 23. _____, 2001, religious experience and mystical apocalypse, Tehran, contemporary knowledge and thought
- 24. _____, 2004, religious experience and mystical intuition, journal of cognition mirror, Shahid Beheshti University
- 25. Ghaemi Nia, A., 2002, religious experience and religion essence, Qom, Boustan-e- Ketab
- 26. _____, 2002, revelation and verbal actions, Qom, society of Islamic thoughts

| Adab Al-Kufa Journal No. 49 / P2 Muharram 1443 / Sep 2021 | ISSN Print 1994 – 8999 ISSN Online 2664-469X | مجلن آداب الکوفن العدد :٤٩ / ج٢ محرم ١٤٤٣ هـ /ايلول ٢٠٢١ |
|---|---|--|
|---|---|--|

- 27. Ghashiri, A., 1995, Resaleh Ghashirieh, Qom, Bidar pub.
- 28. Kashani, A., 1936, Sharh Manazel alSaerin, Tehran, old ed.
- 29. Kakaei, G., 2004, religious experience, mystical experience and criteria of recognition of them from Ibn Arabi's viewpoint, journal of Iranian Islamic thought society, vol. 1, no. 1
- 30. Kalabazi, A., 1970, summary of Sharh alTaarof, corrected by Rajaei, A., Tehran, foundation of Iran culture
- 31. Koleini, M., 2009, Osoul Kafi, Tehran, almaktaba aleslamieh
- 32. Miles, T., 2001, religious experience, translated by Akbari, J., Tehran, Sohrevardi
- 33. Malouf, L., 1995, almanjad fi loghat, bija dehghani
- 34. Moein, M., 1983, Moein dictionary, Tehran, Amir Kabir
- 35. Mousavi Khoemeini, R., 1981, mesbah alhedaya ela alkhalafa va alvelaya, translated by Fahri, A., Tehran, payam azadi
- 36. _____, 1998, description of mind and ignorance troops, Tehran, institution of publication of Emam Khomeini works
- Hajviri, A., 1957, kashf almahjoub, corrected by Jokovski, V., by Abbasi, M., Bija, Amir Kabir
- 38. ____, 2004, journal of seminary and university, Qom, center of research of seminary and university, 10th year
- 39. Hordren, W., 1989, guide to Protestant theology, translated by Michaelian, T., Tehran, scientific and cultural pub.

Adab Al-Kufa Journal No. 49 / P2 Muharram 1443 / Sep 2021 ISSN Print 1994 – 8999 ISSN Online 2664-469X مجلة آداب الكوفة العدد ٤٩٠ / ج٢ محرم ١٤٤٢ هـ / ايلول ٢٠٢١