

نساء قيرغيزستان اللائي تم الاتجار بهن في كتاب مارينكا فرانولوفيتش "امراتان قيرغيزستان"

المدرس زينة عبد الحسين حسن

الجامعة المستنصرية

zahhkh@uomustansiriyah.edu.iq

**TRAFFICKED KYRGYZ WOMEN IN MARINKA
FRANULOVIC'S BOOK "TWO KYRGYZ WOMEN"**

**Lecturer Zina Abdul-Hussein Hassan
Mustansiriyah University**

المستخلص

ورقة البحث مستوحاة من قصة حقيقية تعتمد على امرأتين تعانين من الاتجار. لتلخيص الاستنتاج ، تناقش الورقة عوامل ومخاطر الاتجار ، وخاصة النساء. الاتجار بالنساء جريمة مروعة. يحتاج إلى وضع حد لمعاناة المرأة. وقد تعرض المثالان للإناث من كتاب "امراتان قيرغيزستان" للعديد من المخاطر. تعرضوا للضرب والتهديد والاغتصاب.

الهدف من الورقة هو مناقشة أنه إذا تم التعامل مع العوامل التي ساعدت النساء ليتم الاتجار بهن منذ البداية ، فلن يكون هناك إتجار بالنساء. هذه العوامل كثيرة مثل: - الغش من خلال الوظائف الواعدة ، والظروف السياسية غير المستقرة ، والممارسات الاجتماعية والثقافية التي تقلل من قيمة المرأة في مجتمعها ، ودور النوع الاجتماعي في المجتمع الذي يظهر أن المجتمع يفضل الأولاد أكثر من الفتيات ، وسوء فهم الأعراف الاجتماعية. لكن في الواقع ، لم يتم تحديد هذه العوامل وحظرها لمساعدة المجتمع القيرغيزي ولكن المجتمع نفسه هو العامل الرئيسي الذي يشجع النساء على مغادرة بلدهن من أجل العيش ، ومن ناحية أخرى لا يشارك الشريك الذكر في الدعم النساء؛ هذا سيتم مناقشته وإثباته في الصفحات القادمة.

الكلمات المفتاحية: «الاتجار بالنساء القيرغيزي ؛ وظيفة واعدة ، الظروف السياسية ، الممارسة الاجتماعية والثقافية ، ودور النوع الاجتماعي في المجتمع؛ سوء فهم الأعراف الاجتماعية ؛ الرأسمالية»

Abstract

The research paper was inspired by a true story that depends on two women who suffered from trafficking.

To sum up, the paper discusses the factors and risks of trafficking, specifically women. Trafficking of women is a horrible crime; it needs to put an end to women's suffering. Two examples of females from the book "Two Kyrgyz Women", had been exposed to many risks. They were beaten, threatened, and raped.

The aim of the paper is to discuss that if the factors that aided women to be trafficked were treated from the early beginning, there would be no trafficking women. Those factors are many such as: - cheated by promising jobs, unstable political conditions, social and cultural practices that devalue women in their society, gender roles in society that shows society prefers boys more than girls, and the misconception of social norms. But in fact, those factors are not determined and banned with the help of Kyrgyz society, on the contrary, the society itself is the main factor that encourages women to leave their country for the sake of living. On the other hand, male partner does not take any part for supporting women; this is going to be discussed and proved in the coming pages.

Key Words: [Kyrgyz women trafficking; promising job; political conditions; social and cultural practice, gender roles in society; misconception of social norms; Capitalism]

SECTION ONE INTRODUCTION

This paper cares for a very sensitive issue which is “women trafficking”. It is a global problem but without any real efforts to stop it yet. Wikipedia refers to “trafficking” as the trade of humans for purposes like forced labor, sexual captivity, or commercial sexual exploitation for the trafficker or others. This paper gives two examples of trafficked women from Kyrgyzstan, based on their testimony. Kyrgyzstan is located in central Asia and it is surrounded by its high mountain terrain, its capital is Bishkek.

“Two Kyrgyz Women” is a book that consisted of two real stories revealed by two Kyrgyz women whose names are Ainura and Gulnara. They were victims of trafficking and they were telling their stories about their position and life before they were trafficked and when they were in trafficked countries. Two stories, which were written in (2007) by a Croatian author, Marinka Franulovic, are entitled “Ainura’s Journey” and “Life Is More Unpredictable than Fiction” have stressed their painful reality when they were trafficked in addition to the main factors that helped to be victimized and the different risks that both women exposure to. Trafficking has happened in two different countries; Ainura is trafficked in Kazakhstan while Gulnara is trafficked in Dubai. In the first part, the two stories are going to be mentioned in order to be very clear to the keen eyes, starting with Ainura, then with Gulnara. In the second part, the main factors which help to recruit those two women are going to be explored. The third part, risks that those two women have been exposed to, is going to be discussed. Finally, it is going to end up with a conclusion to show the find out of the paper.

ABOUT AINURA

Franulovic and a translator communicated with Ainura in the Russian language. Ainura and her son, Ali, stayed in IOM which is a shelter in Bishkek for victims of domestic violence and human trafficking. Ainura was twenty-six years old and Ali was eight months. They started a conversation with her.

The story was written in the third person narration “she”. Ainura is a village girl from the south region called Uzgen. Every winter, she had to travel to the capital and stay with her aunt for having a work at a sewing factory which laid in the suburb of Bishkek, but in summer she went back to Uzgen where her family lives. Her job at a sewing factory was

not enough because her parents became poor after they lost their stable jobs, though they had land which provided them with food. After a while, she found a job as a cooker in a bazaar's eatery where she met her future husband, Ulan.

Ulan was a poor young man and his family too. He was even unable to pay a dowry "Kalym" to Ainura's family, therefore, he kidnapped her. The phenomenon of bride kidnapping has become a common way for Kyrgyz to get married as no one loses face and tradition is upheld [Franulovic, 2007: 17].

Ainura had got two sons from him. Later on, she found that her husband is addicted to vodka, whenever he drunk, he became mad and jealous. Unfortunately, she had been sold about 300 dollars to another owner after she had delivered her second baby, Ali. She was deceived by them as they promised her to have worked at a shop in Almaty, Kazakhstan. She left her first son who was three years old with her parents and started her journey to Kazakhstan. She accepted that offer in thinking that was a better opportunity for her and her family, especially since her husband was jobless and useless. When she got to Kazakhstan, she found out that she was going to work on a tobacco farm.

In the tobacco farm, her work was true hell because if anyone could not work for any reason, he was going to be beaten by faithful followers "henchmen" of the owner. The pressure of the work was not bearable anymore she became a "living skeleton", so she decided to tell the owner to let her go. The owner did not say anything but he sent his henchmen to punish her by beating and raping her. After that horrible incident, she has been sold to a woman for 250,000 tenges around 300\$.

In her new job, she was enslaved to take care of a woman's parents and their land for half a year. In spite of the woman's parents treated Ainura and her son well, but she was still a slave, they imprisoned her for she owed them 250,000 tenges [ibid., 44].

Ainura blamed herself for leaving her home where her parents and the drunk husband were. however, she realized that her expectations were very wrong. Her final days in the mountains before she escaped back to her country, were not good as she was always in need of clothes for herself and her baby, but fortunately, her skills in sewing helped to live her life. When she had been on a tobacco farm, she had known a traveling Kyrgyz man whom she met again. His job was selling tents and he came to offer his goods to her owners in the mountains, immediately

she begged him to return her to Kyrgyzstan. That man was her hope and he was the reason to be with her family again. He helped her as well as helped other enslaved women.

ABOUT GULNARA

Franulovic met the second girl whose name was Gulnara. She was a victim of trafficking for the purpose of being sexually exploited.

The story is told in the first-person narration "I". Gulnara is the only girl in her family with three brothers. She is an educated girl as well as her parents and well brought up by them as she was very close to her father as a precious pearl. She completed her study at the University of Economics in Bishkek. She was from northern Kyrgyzstan called Chui Province, and after her marriage, she lived in Tokmok.

Gulnara lived in two eras, when Kyrgyzstan was within the Soviet Union and when Kyrgyzstan is independent. That era was very difficult for Kyrgyz as many people had lost their jobs or their salaries were miserable. After independence in 1990, her mother as soon as possible left her job as a midwifery in the Tokmok hospital and moved to her grandparents' village where she was able to live honorably.

Her father was a forester that cared for a forest and the animals. He died because of a doctor's mistake when she was twenty years old, and that was the first sorrow in her life. The day of her father's death was not easy; but in fact, she lost protection, support, and the advice of a wise father. So, the changes in political issues besides her father's death affected the whole of her family.

Her middle brother who was very young married after a few months of his father's death. His marriage brought to the family more sorrow because it was neither suitable nor the girl he had chosen nor the time.

After five months Gulnara got married to a young man, Bakyt, who was studying at Economics University. He was one year older than her and she loved him so much. He was a good man with a good reputation at the university. He has one married brother and a sister but he lived alone with his mother. The way that they got married was not ordinary, he kidnapped her because this way is very common among Kyrgyz people. So men who did not have enough money to make a wedding ceremony, kidnap their brides, and it was very suitable for the bride's family side.

Gulnara and Bakyt were two married students. Their economic state was not good so both are supported by mother law, Bakyt's mother.

After they had got two kids a boy and a girl, they decided to dwell in Tokmok in order to be near their mothers and their relatives. Their economic state did not get better and it was not stable, although both were young graduated people. On other hand, Bakyt's older brother died by cancer leaving a three years old boy. So they became responsible for that boy, notably, the boy's mother who had left him to remarry. Later on, Gulnara found that Bakyt was not a responsible man he did not afford fatherhood beside the circumstances of the county were not good either.

In the independence period, many Russian people sold their apartments in a hurry to go to Russia. The emigrant Russians had affected the economics of Kyrgyzstan badly, but in return, that the young couple had the chance to buy an apartment. In spite of Bakyt had employed at Tokmok City Council, his work did not go well, even worse, he devalued Gulnara, he had not found it important to ask her anything, however, as an educated woman, she had wanted to participate in the decision-making [ibid., 85]. Bakyt was selfish, he cared for himself only but not for the family. He started ignoring her and flattering with his secretary girl whose name was Chinara. So the shatter became wider between them. [ibid].

Later, Bakyt left his relationship with his girlfriend and turned back to Gulnara; in that period, she was working in a guesthouse with a very low salary. So, her husband found for her another job in the city's tax department with a salary of \$50 a month [ibid., 103]. That period of stability of marriage and economics in the couple's life, had also changed with the revolution in Kyrgyzstan which started on March 24, 2005, Bakyt who had supported Akayev, lost his job on the Tokmok City Council as well as Gulnara. After the revolution, their life became so difficult economically, that the situation had pushed Gulnara to think about her family's future resulting to communicate with her brother's bad wife "Nurgul" to help her overlapping on economic problems.

Later on, she found out that Nurgul was responsible for her trafficking with a help of Nurgul's brother "Shairbek" who and a corrupted officer of Kyrgyzstani airport facilitated her journey to Dubai. In the beginning, Gulnara did not know she was trapped as she promised to get Iran a visa from Dubai. Unfortunately, she was captured in Dubai by a young woman whose name was Adele who kept Gulnara's passport with her in order to not escape. Then and there, Gulnara was informed by the young women that Nurgul sold her around \$ 7,000 and she was going

to work as a prostitute. At the first time, Gulnara was far away from her country, she did not know anyone to help her, she was educated, but she did not know either English or Arabic. After many tries to help Gulnara herself get out of that trouble, by chance, she found a dictionary of Kyrgyzstanis from where she learned a few English words and called the police about the flat where she stayed with other women who were captured all in the police station. Gulnara was lucky to overlap over her hard times without losing her dignity to herself and returned to her family in Kyrgyzstan.

SECTION TWO THE MAIN FACTORS

This chapter discusses the main factors that lead to prey women in forced labor or exploit them for sexual purposes, besides their unstable life helps those women to fall to human traffickers in Kyrgyz society. Kyrgyz society is divided into two parts which are the poor rural part and the rich civil part. According to the United Nations Office of Drugs and Crime, there are causes of human trafficking which are leaving a place of poverty to gain wealth, political conditions, and social and cultural practices. All these factors can be seen in Kyrgyz society, but the main important factor in addition to mentioned factors is the society itself. It is going to prove that masculine society and gender roles participate in the trafficking of women.

The two young women in the book "Two Kyrgyz Women" have similar and different things. First, Ainura is a village girl from south Kyrgyzstan, from Uzgen village while Gulnara is from north Kyrgyzstan, from Chui Province. Second, Ainura is an uneducated woman while Gulnara is an educated woman. Both are married, and they have a family and children. Both are trafficked but in two different countries and purposes. Ainura has been forced for hard labor and sold twice by different owners in Kazakhstan. On the other hand, Gulnara has been exploited by her brother's wife for sexual activity in Dubai.

In the coming pages, light will be shed on these two examples in relating to mentioned factors.

LEAVING KYRGYZSTAN FOR PROMISING JOB

Ainura and Gulnara are victims of human trafficking. Both want to get out of their situation risking everything to leave the place where has mired them in poverty. In fact, poverty has been considered being so close to aligning with the feminization of immigration" [Russell, 2014:

536]. So, they became victims of human traffickers who lure women to move to a different country.

Those traffickers lied, promised those victims to have jobs and stability in order to recruit them [Barner et al., 2014; Berton, 2000; Scarpa, 2006; Russell, 2014; Tavcer, 2006]. When they got to another state or region, captors take control by taking their passports which is the only official document in a strange country. Ainura was deceived by her first owner of a restaurant where she was working as a cooker in a bazaar's eatery. She was promised to have a job at a shop in Almaty where is a region in Kazakhstan; on the contrary, she found herself working on a tobacco farm. She had been sold to another owner by the first owner after she had delivered her second baby, Ali around 300 dollars. On the other hand, trusting one member of a family to find a proper job creates vulnerability. Gulnara trusted her brother's wife "Nurgul" to get her a job in Iran but she was trafficked and sold to prostitution in Dubai for around \$7,000. "Kyrgyz women consider their brother's wife as a sister" [Franulovic 114]. As a result, the promising job was a lie made by well-known relatives.

POLITICAL CONDITIONS IN KYRGYZSTAN

The consequence of political instability or civil unrest can do an increase in trafficking as well. Vulnerability to unfair treatment and abuse via trafficking and forced labor of women are increased by the dislocation and scattering of populations. Both Ainura and Gulnara lived in a period of revolution. After the Soviet Union dissolute, Ainura's parents' permanent jobs are lost at the "kolkhoz" farming cooperative which brought them a monthly income [ibid., 15].

The socio-economic situation began to decline with the independence of Kyrgyzstan; as well, the migration of ethnic minorities like; Russians, Ukrainians, Germans, Jews, and others to their native country made the economy worse [Kolpakov, 2001: 15].

Another key point, those ethnic minorities were owners of luxury shops so their migrations made many shops being closed. So, many Kyrgyzs have lost their jobs. To overcome their bad economic situation, many Kyrgyz people had left their country. On the other hand, Askar Akayev who was the president of Kyrgyzstan had failed to recover the depleted economy [ibid., 4].

Ainura's husband, Ulan, and Gulnara's husband, Bakyt, were an example of young married men without a job. Whenever Bakyt started

working, he immediately lost his work, though he was an educated man. At that time, each Kyrgyzstani was poor and because everyone around Gulnara was poor, she felt no bad about being poor herself [Franulovic 78]. In March 2005, demonstrators made a revolution which ended Akayev's government. This political situation made many young men who were Akayev's supporters to lose their job. Bakyt lost his job on the Tokmok City Council, moreover, Gulnara also lost her job because she was "the wife of an Akayev-supporting husband." [ibid.,105].

The outcome of that instability of political situations makes people more to be lured by traffickers, women, and children are the most. [Rieger, 2007: 235] As a result, the instability of political conditions had affected the economic life of Kyrgyz people who become an easy bite for swindlers.

SOCIAL AND CULTURAL PRACTICES

Despite Kyrgyz society being a multi-religion society, but Islam is the main religion in Kyrgyzstan according to Wikipedia. Accordingly, a woman's status in Islam as a daughter, wife, and mother are distinguished and it gives her personal and social rights, hence insuring her active participation in society [Greenberg, 1995]; as a contrast, Kyrgyz society and culture practices devalue women. First, the kidnapping of brides in Kyrgyz society by their suitors has cheapened the position of women, that the phenomenon of kidnapping the bride has become a common way for Kyrgyz to get married as no one loses face and tradition is upheld [ibid]. This cheap way of marriage exists, because It is so suitable for men rather women and because men were unable to pay a dowry "Kalym" to women's family, nevertheless, the process of the bride kidnapping is horrible for those women because not all the kidnapped brides are lucky to be with their suiters; they may be kidnapped by strangers as Ainura's and Gulnara's witness. Second, another contrast is that social practice also abuses and exploits women and girls, for example, Ainura had been sold to another owner by her first men-owners for 250,000 tenges (Kazakh currency) [Franulovic 18] when she was in Kyrgyzstan. Third, because Kyrgyz people are "tribal" [Kolpakov 4] in which their culture depends on the notion of men are unlike women, that is why women at the IOM shelter advised Gulnara that she should be careful of what she says to her family about what happened to her in Dubai because her family would never be able to understand her situation [Franulovic 58].

According to the United Nations Office of Drugs and Crime notices that “with little opportunities of helping women with their living and with little value placed on women and girls” as in the Kyrgyz society, it can be found that those women are “more vulnerable to human trafficking.” As a result, all the three mentioned practices as kidnapping brides, selling women, and unequal rights of women with boys also have helped to be exposed to human trafficking.

GENDER ROLE IN KYRGYZ SOCIETY

A sex/gender system in patriarchal society gives high value for men over women where men dominate women and depress them [Chesney-Lind, 2006: 9] which have an impact on women and girls to be trafficked [Busch, et al., 2004; United Nations, 2013; Samarasinghe, 2015].

Sociologists often see patriarchy as “a social product” and not as a result of natural differences between the sexes as they emphasize the way that gender roles affect power differentials between men and women in society [Macionis, 2012; Henslin, 2001].

Ainura's husband is jobless and addicted to vodka; whenever he drank, he became jealous and he accused Ainura of flirting with men she had never talked to and blamed her for directing attention toward men she had never seen. On the other hand, Gulnara's husband, Bakyt, was not “a good family man”, [Franulovic 88] he did not find that her opinion is important to be asked, or he did not let her participate in “the decision-making” [ibid., 85].

In fact, Bakyt is selfish, he cared for himself, but not for his family, for example, he bought a Mazda car without back doors, and when she asked him how their three children might get into the car, his reaction about her opinion was that he got angry and called her “stupid woman”, and she doesn't “understand anything”.

In addition, he betrayed her with his secretary whose name is “Chinara” and became uninterested in Gulnara at all [ibid., 90]. Besides, Gulnara concentrated on giving birth to many children, this is part of eastern society which encourages families to have a lot of children in spite of how bad their situations or health condition of women are.

[A house with children is beautiful

As a flowerbed; a house without

Children is somber as a grave].

Kyrgyz folk song” [ibid., 107]

Those two women are suffering from their husbands; however, gender role plays an important role to make women submissive, obedient

in Kyrgyz society. "In many societies women are ascribed second-class citizen status and are not afforded the same rights and liberties as men" [Baykotan, 2014].

[Live with sweetheart or live with an odious spouse,
We serve one who we married once.
Good or bad he is, it doesn't matter
Listen to him, not to listen is bad.
A host is your husband; you be obedient...]

From the book: Kyrgyzstan My Motherland

[Franulovic 94].

Accordingly, the feminization of migration results from increasingly dependent on households and whole communities on women for their survival. [Sassen, 2000: 503; Russell, 2014]. So, the sequences of gender roles make two women leave their country to seek a better life for their own children and their family and the result is the trafficking of those two women. On the other hand, this is contrasted with Islam in which man is responsible to take care of his wife and her needs. To this end, Kyrgyz men do not take any responsibility for their families as expected.

THE MISCONCEPTION OF SOCIAL NORMS BROUGHT BY CAPITALISM

From this perspective, women who are trafficked for the purposes of sexual exploitation should be understood. There are women who are enforced to work unwillingly as prostitutes, as well as situations may force women prostitutes to work under unwilling conditions. However, capitalism has added a new element to slavery is that workers are free to sell their labor. Therefore, according to certain opinions, women should be free to sell their sexual availability as labor, so in this case the misconception of social norms has changed, when Gulnara asked some girls how they could work as prostitutes. One girl answered that they are not. It is not what she thinks and she added prostitution in Dubai is not like in Kyrgyzstan, another girl said that men treat them well. Those men whom they go with, are better to them than their husbands at home [Franulovic 131]. However, the over-exploitation in sexual trafficking can be realized that those women who sell their sexual availability as labor are forced to sell not only their availability, but their freedom and identity as well [Boaventura et al., 2010].

Marx stated that exploitation of labor is one of the capitalist wealth conditions, this ideology is very strong in Kyrgyz society as one of the

Soviet Union colonies in which it could be seen that those young women “Ainura” and “Gulnara” are exploited firstly by their known people and relatives who were responsible for their trafficking and secondly by society in which many corrupted officers had facilitated their trafficking. [Marx, 1874; Zwolinski, et al., 2017: 1]

Unknown destination (unknown countries)
Dangerous journey (long, notorious, lawless journey)
No free will (do not have permission to leave)
Hard labor (unsuitable, difficult or notorious labor)
Expose to violence (raping, sexual activity, beating and killing)
psychological problems (PTSD, Guilt, shame, and self-blame)

Chart illustrating the link between the factors and the risks of trafficking

SECTION THREE RISKS OF TRAFFICKING

If the factors that help women to be recruited have been treated from the beginning, there will be no violence crimes lay down on women. Unfortunately, those factors made the women as sold products, moreover those factors help to endanger those women of risks.

This section presents those women who are “selling products” how they are depressed and helpless because “Trafficking” is a violent crime. Traffickers do different ways to keep those women imprisoned as: harms, threatens to harm or even conspires to harm someone else. Violent crimes are offenses which involve force or threat of force, such as rape, robbery or homicide” [Montaldo, 2019].

Since, Trafficking is a violent crime, women who are trafficked are victims because they have been hurt or taken advantage of [Wagele, 2011]. Accordingly, this crime has risks upon women and girls, different painful feelings and agony will arise inside those women. In this coming pages those risks are going to illuminate with referring to Ainura and Gulnara.

- **UNKNOWN DESTINATION:** -Most of the trafficked women do not know their going destination; Ainura was promised to work at a shop in Almaty, Kazakhstan, but she ended into Tobacco farm [Franulovic

29] as well Gulnara was promised to have a good job at Iran, but she was restricted in Dubai, thinking she is going to get the visa to Iran from Dubai [ibid., 113].

- **DANGEROUS JOURNEY:** - Most of them have to do a very long and dangerous journey; Ainura' journey was very difficult because she was driven by a van with other passengers who some of them were smoking as she was taking her infant "Ali" with her, one of the young men tried to tease her, beside, the weather was very cold that "the young woman's fingers, ears and the tip of her nose burned with cold" [ibid., 22].
- **NO FREE WILL:** - Whenever traffickers have captured those victims, they imprison them, take all official documents from them, and also, threat those lured people to keep them under control. The two examples Ainura and Gulnara have been captured and threaten and their passports were taken. Besides, most women who took their children with them have no free well towards their children's future so those children may expose to a bad treatment or they may be sold to another family in the two cases are unavoidable; that what had been happened with Ainura. The unfree welling to keep her baby is realized especially after a strange man came in accompany with the owner and made an offer to buy her baby. That man had urged the young woman that selling her baby in exchange for money was the reasonable decision, which would bring her good today than an infant boy [ibid., 37].
- **HARD LABOR:** -Most of them involve in unsuitable work or heavy labor; Ainura realized that her work in the farm was true hell because if anyone could not work for any reason, he was going to be beaten by faithful followers "henchmen" of the owner. Because the pressure of the work was not a bearable anymore, Ainura became a "living skeleton" so, the period of planting tobacco seed to the stage the plant of tobacco is reaped as well as treated, as well, the people who grow the crop, their health is always at danger. [Mackay, 2005]. In the fact that women who are working on the tobacco farm frequently suffer from "green tobacco sickness (*GTS*)" [Arcury, et al., 2003; Ballard, et al., 1995].
- **EXPOSE TO VIOLENCE:** - Most of them, if not all expose to violence, rape or sexual activity; in the farm where Ainura was, the

owner and his people had become more ruthless in their treatment of the laborers, shouts and threats of beating are the language they had used and even developed to murder those laborers [Franulovic 38].

When Ainura asked the owner to let her go, she was punished by henchmen who had mercilessly beaten the young woman and brutally had raped her [ibid., 40]. In return, Gulnara was involved in sexual activity as a prostitute against her will in Dubai and if she refused to do, she was threatening by the recruiter "Adele" to "call twenty Arabs to rape" her and she would do that job just to get them off of her"

- **PSYCHOLOGICAL PROBLEMS:** -Most of them have psychological effects that include: *Post Traumatic Stress Disorder* (PTSD), Low self-esteem; emotional effects include Guilt, shame, self-blame, and physical effects include: changes in eating or sleeping patterns, Concerns about physical safety [Borja, a al., 2006; Ellis, et al., 1981; Erdreich, et al., 1995].

Psychologists such as John B. Watson, Robert Plutchik, and Paul Ekman have suggested that there is only a small set of basic or innate emotions and that fear is one of them. So, "Fear" is a feeling induced by perceived danger or threat, Ainura felt the danger of working on the farm. Nonetheless in the coming days her fear turned to anxiety. According to the *American Psychiatric Association* (2013), "anxiety" is not the same as fear, which is a response to a real or perceived immediate threat, whereas anxiety involves the expectation of the future threat. Gulnara's anxiety was very clear; she metaphorically resembled her life like "a picture on a playing card – destined always to be in someone else's hand" [Franulovic 131].

The anxiety of her thought made her calling herself "a stupid woman" different mixed feelings had been shown in details "I cried for a long time. I could not see a way out of my situation. What if those Arab men, with their long white skirts, did come to this room to rape me?" [ibid], and when she agreed to work in order to free herself of the debt of selling process by \$7,000, her feeling was "like I was going to my own execution" [ibid., 134].

As a result, all these risks that mentioned above are deeply horrible crimes beside those women who were still captured by human traffickers are in need to be free.

CONCLUSION

Depending on the testimony of two abused victims, Ainura and Gulnara, this paper has discussed in its first part the factors which assist in alluring these women by traffickers. The first factor is the promised job by which those women can help themselves and their families, so they risked traveling to foreign countries without even knowing the language of those foreign countries. Beside, undisciplined borders between the two countries have allowed immigrants to travel freely, nevertheless, corrupted officers who control the borders get bribes and making deals with those traffickers in order to facilitate those women's pass. The second factor is that the political issues of Kyrgyzstan especially after independence announcement have helped many young people to immigrate to find economic stability. Ainura had left her country because her husband was jobless and addicted to vodka, while Gulnara and her husband were educated, they could not find a job. The third one is that some practices of Kyrgyz have devalued women in the society as the bride kidnapping because men are not able to pay dowries to their brides, so Kyrgyz society has oppressed its women. The fourth one is that women must keep silent even if their husbands mistreat them because of the gender roles. Accordingly, Ainura was mistreated by her husband who devalued her and accused her to flitter with men, as well Gulnara was mistreated by her husband who lowering her position by calling her stupid. Also Kyrgyz society is tribal which encourages giving birth to children in spite of their poor or their marriage relationship is not bonded. The fifth one is the notion of capitalism in Kyrgyz society has affected deeply. In other words, the two examples were exploited by their people first, beside the misconception of norms of other exploited girls has understood their exploitation normal and out of shame which astonished Gulnara when she was in Dubai.

The second part of the paper discusses the risks that those vulnerable women had faced. Firstly, the lured women do not know about the real destination, so most of those women's families do not know anything about their daughters or wives. Secondly, they have to do a very long and difficult journey which is unsuitable and restless. Thirdly, the children who accompany their moms are forcibly taken away and sold by the traffickers, as a result, the place of those children is unknown or no one knows how they are treated. Fourthly, all women suffer from humiliations or ill-treatments which are: rape, physical punishment by beating and their life are threatening to kill. Finally, most works which

are given to those women, are not only shameful but difficult to do, hence, most of them suffer from different physical and psychological illnesses.

Finally, Kyrgyz society is mannish so the patriarch ideology is so deep, finding out that Kyrgyz women are acting as men and as women at the same time. That is, women are economically and socially responsible for their children, and their husbands.

REFERENCES

- American Psychiatric Association (2013), *Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders (Fifth ed.)*. Arlington, VA: American Psychiatric Publishing. p. 189. ISBN 978-0-89042-555-8.
- Arcury T.A., et al. (2003), *High levels of transdermal nicotine exposure produce green tobacco sickness in Latino farm workers*. *Nicotine & Tobacco Research*, 5: 315-321. 10.1080/1462220031000094132.
- Ballard T., et al. (1995), *Green tobacco sickness: occupational nicotine poisoning in tobacco workers*. *Archives of Environmental Health*. 1995, 50: 384-389.
- Barner, J. R. et al. (2014), "Socio-Economic Inequality, Human Trafficking, and the Global Slave Trade," *Societies*, MDPI, Open Access Journal, vol. 4(2), pages 1-13, April.
- Baykotan, C. (2014), *Human trafficking in Turkey: A feminist analysis*. *Fe Dergi*, 6 (2), pp.14-24.
- Boaventura de Sousa, S., et al. (2010), *The Sexual Trafficking of Women: Representations of Illegality and Victimisation*. School of Economics and Centre for Social Studies, University of Coimbra, Portugal
- Borja, SE., et al (2006), *Positive and negative adjustment and social support of sexual assault survivors*. *J Trauma Stress*. 2006 Dec; 19(6):905-14.
- Busch, N.B., et al. (2004), *Human trafficking and domestic violence: Comparisons in research methodology needs and strategies*. *Journal of Social Work Research and Evaluation*, 5(2), pp.137-147.
- Chesney-Lind, M. (2006). *Patriarchy, crime, and justice: Feminist criminology in an era of backlash*. *Feminist Criminology*, 1(1), pp.6-26. doi: 10.1177/1557085105282893
- Ellis, E.M., Atkeson, B.M., & Calhoun, K.S. (1981). *An assessment of long-term reaction to rape*. *Journal of Abnormal Psychology*, 90:3, 263-266.

- Erdreich, B.L., Slavet, B.S., & Amador, A.C. (1995). *Sexual harassment in the federal workplace: Trends, progress, continuing challenges*. Washington, D.C.: U.S. Merit Systems Protection Board.
- [Franulovic, M. \(2007\). *Two Kyrgyz Women*. Edited by Sabrina Valli and Barent Gordinier, Bishkek. \[short%20stories%202018/Two-Kyrgyz-Women.pdf\]\(#\) pages: \[P: 15\], \[P: 17\], \[P: 18\], \[P: 17, 74\], \[P: 22\], \[P: 29\], \[P: 37\], \[P: 38\], \[P: 40\], \[P: 58\], \[P: 78\], \[P: 85\], \[P: 88\], \[P: 90\], \[P: 94\], \[P: 103\], \[P: 105\], \[P: 113\], \[P: 114\], \[P: 130\], \[P: 131\], \[P: 134\].](#)
- Greenberg, H. S. (1995), *Spotlight on the Muslim Middle East Issues of Identity*. The American Forum for Global Education, funded by the U.S. Department of Education, Title VI Grant ISBN#: 0-944675-55-7. New York.
- Henslin, J. M. (2001), *Essentials of Sociology*. Taylor & Francis. pp. 65–67, 240.
- Kolpakov, A. (2001), *Managing Diversity in Kyrgyzstan*. School of Public and Environmental Affairs, Indiana University, Bloomington, Indiana 47405 USA.
- Macionis, J. (2012), *Sociology* (13th ed.). Prentice Hall, Boston.
- Mackay J. (2019), *The Tobacco Atlas*. 2005, Geneva: World Health Organization
- Montaldo, Charles.. What Constitutes a Crime? <https://www.thoughtco.com/what-is-a-crime-970836>
- Marx, K., 1847, *Wage Labour and Capital*, New York: New York Labour News Company, 1902—, 1867, *Capital: A Critique of Political Economy*, vols. 1–3, Chicago: C.H. Kerr and Company, 1906–09.
- Rieger, A. (2007), *Missing the mark: Why the Trafficking Victims Protection Act fails to protect sex trafficking victims in the United States*. Harvard Journal of Law & Gender, 30, pp.231-256
- Russell, A.M. (2014), *"Victims of trafficking": The feminization of poverty and migration in the gendered narratives of human trafficking*. *Societies*, 4(4), pp.532-548. doi: 10.3390/soc4040532
- Sassen, S. (2000). *Women's burden: Counter-geographies of globalization and the feminization of survival*. Journal of International Affairs, 53(2), pp.503-24.
- United Nations Office of Drugs and Crime – https://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/Toolkit-files/08-58296_tool_9-2.pdf
- ["UNODC on human trafficking and migrant smuggling". United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime](#). 2011. Retrieved 22 March 2011.
- Samarasinghe, V. (2015). Female sex trafficking: Gendered vulnerability. In A. Coles, L. Gray & J. Momsen (Eds.) The Routledge

handbook of gender and development (pp. 330–340). New York, NY: Routledge.

- Wagele, E. (2011). *What Does Calling Someone a "Victim" Mean?* <https://www.psychologytoday.com/us/blog/the-career-within-you/201104/what-does-calling-you/201104/what-does-calling-you>
- Zwolinski, M. et al., "Exploitation", *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Summer 2017 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.), URL = <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/sum2017/entries/exploitation/>.