

إستراتيجيات ترجمة الحواشي السينمائية في الأفلام متعددة اللغة

Subtitling strategies in multilingual films

Lect. Jalil Naser Hilu (PhD)

م. د. جليل ناصر حلو

Mustansiriyah University

الجامعة المستنصرية

drjalilhilu@uomustansiriyah.edu.iq**Abstract**

The present paper investigates the multilingualism in films and how it is dealt with in the subtitling process. In cinema, the term “multilingual” is used to address those films depicting intercultural encounters, where two different languages at least are uttered. Multilingual films actually refer to a group of works that emphasise the shared feature of that important and vital stance of multilingualism in the story and its context. The process of subtitling in such films needs to be investigated since subtitling is the means by which viewers comprehend and understand what is the language spoken on screen. The researcher reviews the history of multilingual films, the reasons behind making such films and the relation between multilingualism and subtitling. The multilingual film “Babel” is investigated as a case study since it depicts four different languages and cultures (Arabic, English, Spanish, and Japanese). The present paper investigates the subtitling process in this movie as has been displayed

on Cinemana Application. The researcher reviews the strategies used in the subtitling process for the part related to the Arabic and English pair in the film.

Keywords: *audiovisual translation, Babel, multilingualism, multilingual films, subtitling,*

المستخلص

تبحث هذه الورقة في مسألة تعدد اللغات في الأفلام وكيفية التعامل معها في عملية ترجمة الحواشي السينمائية. يُستخدم مصطلح "متعدد اللغة" في السينما للإشارة إلى الأفلام التي تبرز اللقاءات بين الثقافات حيث يتم تداول لغتين على الأقل. وتشير الأفلام متعددة اللغة واقعاً لمجموعة من الاعمال التي تركز على الصفة المشتركة للموقف المهم والحيوي لتعددية اللغة في القصة وسياقها. وتتطلب عملية ترجمة الحواشي السينمائية لهذا أفلام البحث والدراسة كون ترجمة الحواشي السينمائية هي الوسيلة التي يفهم من خلالها المشاهد ويستوعب اللغة المنطوقة في الشاشة. يستعرض الباحث في ورقته البحثية تأريخ الأفلام متعددة اللغات وأسباب إنتاج هكذا أفلام وكذلك العلاقة بين تعددية اللغة وعملية ترجمة الحواشي السينمائية. ويأخذ الباحث فلم "Babel" متعدد اللغة بوصفه دراسة حالة كونه يبرز لغات وثقافات مختلفة هي (العربية، الإنجليزية، الإسبانية، اليابانية). كما تبحث هذه الورقة في عملية ترجمة الحواشي السينمائية التي اتبعتها تطبيق سينمانا في ترجمة الجزء الذي يتعلق باللغتين الإنجليزية والعربية في هذا الفلم.

الكلمات المفتاحية: *audiovisual translation, Babel, multilingualism, multilingual films, subtitling,*

Introduction

The study of multilingualism is an interdisciplinary field. It actually encompasses a wide range of multidisciplinary fields that are expanding within the fields of linguistics, philology, history, film studies, and cultural studies. Furthermore, the mnemonic foundation of multilingualism is the cosmopolitan cultures and surroundings, which are typically free, colorful, tolerant, and rich in structure. Lee Whorf's linguistic relativism holds that every language reflects a unique *Weltanschauung* (world view) in the same environment (Whorf, 1940).

Literally, “[*m*]aterial culture of multilingualism comprises materialities relating to multilingual way of existence, whether by individuals or by societies.” (Aronin & Laoine, 2013, p. 228). Multilingualism also inspires cinema. It is inherently present in the essence of cinema. The global film business is a multicultural and multilingual organization. Cinematographic multilingualism encompasses ancient, lost, and extinct languages, as well as rare and constructed languages, in addition to existing languages. In numerous regions of the postmodern world, this has become a quotidian reality due to global migratory trends, culturally oriented policies, and post-colonial advancements. Consequently, linguistic and cultural research in the domain of multilingualism has been expanded.

What is audiovisual translation?

Have you ever seen a movie or series and considered, "I wonder how this moment will be translated into a second language?" Watching dubbed or subtitled films is a standard in many European nations, such as Germany, Italy, France, Sweden, and the Netherlands. The two most prevalent techniques of audiovisual translation, dubbing and subtitling, allow audiences whose mother-tongue differs from that of the original film to get to know more about foreign cultures and also understand the spoken language. If a film is dubbed, it implies that the visual portions (and frequently the sound and background sounds) remain the same while translating the spoken segments into another language and are visually adapted to the actors' lip movements and gestures. The goal is to give the impression that all of the characters are speaking the target language. Subtitles, on the other hand, (most of the time in the lower half of the screen) are added as a translated text to the original version of the film or series and function as a linguistic support for viewers to follow the screen.

What is multilingualism?

According to Merriam–Webster digital dictionary, the definition of multilingualism is:

1) *"of, having or expressed in several languages"*

2) *"using or able to use several languages especially with equal fluency."*

And multilingualism is *"a term of Latin origin meaning the use of many languages usually more than two or three...its Greek equivalent is polyglossia"* (Knauth, 2009, p. 60).

People often mention bilingualism when discussing multilingualism. While it provides a convenient environment for multilingualism in practice and study, it differs from other forms of multilingualism. Moreover, it is generally a spontaneous extension of the family structure and social conditions in which the individual is involved, whereas multilingualism is a form of cultural existence. Multilingualism is an individual quality but it has also mass-characteristics. In fact, *"a language is more than just an instrument of communication, it is the mode of expression, of culture, the reflection of an identity."* (Yannic, 2010, p. 32). Then, it represents cultural diversity on an individual and social level.

Multilingual people are different from monolingual people. According to (Moore & Gajo, 2009):

"While monolingual speakers use one single language in all situations, multilingual speakers navigate among languages and do not use each of their languages for the same purposes in all communicative situations, in the same domains, or with the same people" (As cited in (Cenoz, 2013, p. 11).

It is a rhythmical deterritorialisation /reterritorialisation oscillation phenomenon within vast cultural maps of different civilisations. According to the multilingualism

definition of the digital Yivo Encyclopedia: “*It assumes the ability to switch from one language to another in speech, in writing or in reading*” (Harshav, 2011, p. 1). It is a wonderful situation in terms of linguistic competence and cultural richness; it’s also the basis of liberal, democratic, transparent, humanistic, and peaceful dialogue and solution production. According to (Derrida, 1985, p. 165):

“The ‘tower of Babel does not merely figure the irreducible multiplicity of tongues; it exhibits an incompleteness, the impossibility of finishing, of totalizing, of saturating, of completing something on the order of edification, architectural construction, system and architectonics”.

The role of multilingualism on screen

In cinema, the word "multilingual" refers to films that represent an intercultural interaction where SL and TL are spoken. When someone says "multilingual films" (in the plural), he's referring to a wide range of works that all have one thing in common: Multilingualism plays an important part in the plot and background. (on the concepts of story and discourse, see (Chatman, 1978). Comedies and dramas may be multilingual, as their narratives frequently pertain to immigration procedures or the multicultural aspects of modern society (see (Wahl, 2005). In the history of cinema, multilingualism has been used on occasion in action, adventure, sci-fi, historical period dramas, westerns, and thrillers (see (Bleichenbacher, 2008); (O’Sullivan, Translating Popular Film, 2011)).

Multilingual movie as a genre

Films in the relevant literature of cinema industry have been classified into genres such as drama, fantasy, comedy, horror film, criminal film, and so on. (see, for instance, the analysis of American film genres in (Campari, 1983) and (Kaminsky, 1985). Multilingualism is actually a phenomenon that has crosscut every and any of

the traditional cinematic genres since the advent of the sound cinema (see also (O'Sullivan, *Translating Popular Film*, 2011), (Cronin, 2009), (Dwyer, 2005)). Multilingual films, to state it differently, emerge as a "meta-genre": a second-level genre that incorporates and describes many cinematic genres at once. Despite the intriguing trails to categorise European multilingual films (see (Wahl, 2005)), the more flexible idea of multilingual films as a "meta-genre" is used for the context of this research. As a result, the function of multilingualism in each individual film's storyline becomes a distinguishing element of multilingual ones, a service that varies greatly according to the film in question. There are some precursors of the multilingual movie genre in 1980s and 1990s like Jim Jarmusch with his films, *Stranger than Paradise* (1984) and *Night on Earth* (1991), Aki Kaurismaki with *Leningrad Cowboys Go America* (1989), Kevin Costner with *Dance With Wolves* (1990) and Michelangelo Antonioni & Wim Wenders with *Beyond the Clouds* (1995).

Costner employed the original Lakota Sioux language for the native characters in his movie. According to O'Sullivan, this is a turning point (O'Sullivan, 2007, p. 86). Moreover after *Dance with Wolves*, many film directors use original native languages to narrate deservedly stories of native peoples and characters. *Windtalkers* (2002) of John Woo, *The New World* (2005) of Terrence Malick, *Apocalypto* (2007) of Mel Gibson are some examples. Reanimating lost languages of American natives is a redemptive act expressed by the linguistic choice of film directors as multilingualism.

Film industries and film directors, who could be from main-stream cinema, independent cinema or third world cinema, evaluate and interpret eventually this new conjuncture by their films that materialise multilingualism with several aspects.

Chris Wahl is the first to describe the polyglot movie genre in 2005 and he categorised polyglot cinema in five distinct sub-genres:

- | | | |
|----------------|-----------------------|-------------|
| “1. <i>The</i> | <i>fraternization</i> | <i>film</i> |
| 2. <i>The</i> | <i>globalization</i> | <i>film</i> |
| 3. <i>The</i> | <i>migration</i> | <i>film</i> |
| 4. <i>The</i> | <i>colonial</i> | <i>film</i> |
5. *The existential films*” (as cited in (De Bonis, 2015, pp. 23–24).

According to (Atay, 2019), multilingual movie is not a simple aspect of story – it goes in a multilingual environment! – Genre characteristics of a multilingual movie are like these:

- A multilingual movie is defined as a film that incorporates three or more spoken languages.
- The fundamental characteristic of a storyline is the linguistic diversity among characters or the linguistic variety present in polyglot characters.
- The plot is constructed through the rhizomatic articulation of various languages.
- Multilingualism serves as a useful framework for examining the human condition within its aesthetic, political, historical, mnemonic, geographical, and cultural dimensions.
- A multilingual film represents a landscape characterized by linguistic deterritorializations.
- A multilingual film possesses a distinct aesthetic, as multilingualism ontologically influences its composition.

Cinematography and film editing in the multilingual movie genre serve as visual representations of linguistic mobility, facilitating navigation between different languages, cultural nuances, and the varying characteristics of language speakers.

Hence, the increase in the production and distribution possibilities of the films, which are designed in a multilingual manner in content and form, attracts the attention of researchers who work in the field of linguistics and film studies.

In general, multilingualism appears to serve three purposes in films: realistically conveying the language conditions shown, generating tension, and inducing uncertainty. It seems to be a way to improve viewers' sense of the world portrayed on television in terms of realistic transferring. Linguistic variety is also a method for audiences to cope with the globalisation of our world, which is at the heart of the narratives of multilingual films. On the one hand, a film may depict different linguistic-cultural identities in different scenes without necessarily representing a cross-language interaction, as it happens in some moments of films such as *"Gran Torino"* (Clint Eastwood, 2008), *"Incendies"* (Denis Villeneuve, 2010) *"Hereafter"* (Clint Eastwood, 2010), and the anthology film *"Tickets"* (Ermanno Olmi, Abbas Kiarostami, Ken Loach, 2005).

On the other hand, a film may be in one or more "secondary languages" which are always kept in the background throughout the film, as opposed to the "primary language", the main language of communication in the film (Heiss, 2004). Frequently left untranslated, these "secondary languages" function as a semiotic device, a sound effect that enhances viewers' perception of the on-screen world, interacting with other visual elements like decor, clothing, and accessories. Examples are films such as *"Empire of the Sun"* (Steven Spielberg, 1987), *"The English Patient"* (Anthony Minghella, 1996), *"Kingdom of Heaven"* (Ridley Scott, 2005), and the four films in the Indiana Jones saga all directed by Steven Spielberg: *"Raiders of the Lost Ark"* (1981), *"Indiana Jones and the Temple of Doom"* (1984), *"Indiana Jones and the Last Crusade"* (1989) and *"Indiana Jones and the Kingdom of the Crystal Skull"* (2008).

In contrast, when an interpersonal interaction is depicted on film, multilingualism may represent either conflict or uncertainty when two or more different languages interact in the same scene. The former is a common feature of drama films in which lingua-cultural identities are vividly expressed and preserved on screen. As a result, multilingualism serves as a method for the characters to emphasise their cultural and linguistic variety, resulting in communicative issues that are typically difficult to resolve. The stories are mostly concerned with conflict or immigration/integration procedures; this is the case in films like *"The Pianist"* (Roman Polanski, 2002), *"Lebanon"* (Samuel Maoz, 2009), *"Inglourious Basterds"* (Quentin Tarantino, 2009), *"Gegen die Wand"* (Fatih Akin, 2004), *"It's a Free World"* (Ken Loach, 2007) and *"Welcome"* (Philippe Lioret, 2009).

Confusion is a feature commonly found in comedies dealing with the multicultural aspect of contemporary society. Multilingualism frequently has a comedic impact, since lingua-cultural identities appear to be jumbled up on screen in an unorganised manner. Examples are *"L'auberge espagnole"* (Cédric Klapisch, 2002), *"My Big Fat Greek Wedding"* (Joel Zwick, 2002), *"Mambo italiano"* (Émile Gaudreault, 2003), *"Spanglish"* (James L. Brooks, 2004), *"Les poupées russes"* (Cédric Klapisch, 2005), *"Everything is Illuminated"* (Liev Schreiber, 2005) and *"Almanya – Willkommen in Deutschland"* (Yasemin Samdereli, 2011).

Conflict and perplexity exist on two levels: in the interactions between the characters (diegetic level) and in the audience's perception of the reality depicted on the screen (i.e. the extra-diegetic level). This implies they work on both the horizontal and vertical levels of communication (Vanoye, 1985); (Sanz Ortega, 2015). Given that multilingualism is a key characterisation (see also (Sanz Ortega, 2015), (Bleichenbacher, 2008), (Wahl, 2005)), it is obvious that the use of multiple languages on the screen is always aimed at a more realistic interpretation of linguistic

variety, even when multilingualism may be used to cause either conflict or misunderstanding. The notion of realistic transferring is presented to explain those films in which multiple languages are spoken at separate times in the plot, without interaction between these languages.

The reasons for multilingual films

Given the linguistic fragmentation and the large number of countries or languages crammed into such a small space, one might believe that the old continent and its audiovisual productions are equally diverse, if not more so, than works from other parts of the world where linguistic uniformity is the norm. There is little doubt that multilingualism has always been more or less widespread not only in European movies, but also in Hollywood films, but there is no evidence that either of those two cinema power centres favours multilingualism over normalisation. If it seems that certain European authors of the past had a serious reflection on the linguistic plurality of films, nowadays it is true that society, via technology and people's migration, is confronted more with multilingual and multicultural circumstances. Language contacts have grown frequent, and multilingualism does not appear to be seen as a communication barrier, but as a new form of communication. And as a reflection of the reality and an effort to bring truth to stories, the film business offers audiences an increasing number of works in which diverse languages and cultures are spoken and represented. Unlike monolingual, linguistically standardised and uniform films, if not global, multilingual films are aimed at being real and living; they are a mirror of society. Various personalities speak various languages with distinct accents in real life like actual people talk. In this perspective, certain current blockbusters like *Lost in Translation* (2003), *Babel* (2006), *Spanglish* (2004) and *The Interpreter* (2005) make polyglots and differences their own *raison d'être*. Films sometimes strive to be more realistic in terms of language than their book versions. The cinematographic version

of *The Da Vinci Code* (2006), for instance, adapts to English and French, whereas the original work puts itself to English only. Apart from the added value of "reality mimesis", there are other reasons why film directors and producers are keen to use multilingualism in their films. This typically happens with the financial support and assistance of global organisations and production firms in different nations in the form of international co-productions. (European Commission n.d., online) emphasises that:

"In this regard, and since 1991, the Media programme of the EU for the European audiovisual industry has supported the development and distribution of thousands of films as well as training activities, festivals and promotional projects throughout the continent. The programme supports the distribution of 9 out of every 10 feature films in Europe distributed outside their country of origin and lends its support to some 300 new European film projects every year. Having as one of its main objectives to strive for a stronger European audiovisual sector, reflecting and respecting Europe's cultural identity and heritage".

Many of the films supported by this initiative focus on instances of multilingual interchange to portray European variety and identity, which is unsurprising: *"La vita è bella"* (1997); *"L'auberge espagnole"* (2002); *"Auf der anderen Seite"* (2007); *"Code Inconnu: Récit incomplet de divers voyages"* (2000); *"Land and Freedom"* (1995); or *"Mar adentro"* (2004) These just a handful of the countless films and works in which multilingualism is intricately woven to give a feeling of realism. It is sometimes an effort to mimic the quest of realism as part of the "new wave" amongst filmmakers attempting to depict situations of migrant and diasporic living, according to (Wahl, 2005). In this regard, post-colonialism and globalisation may have prompted a spike

in the production of multilingual films, which has resulted in an increase in the number of studies on the subject.

Multilingualism and subtitling

While dubbing multilingual films is definitely difficult, subtitling them may be just as difficult. As mentioned by Cronin: *"Subtitles [...] maintain the linguistic alterity of what is on the screen, the soundtrack of language matching the identity of the image"* (Cronin, 2009, p. 106). In contrast to dubbing, subtitling seems to have more effect in preserving diegetic linguistic and cultural diversities because whatever that happens on the screen is only understandable by the audience of the film. The English version of *Lo concert*, for example, in this regard does not provide a trace of what are languages spoken in the dialogues of the movie (for example, a different font): The code-switching between Russian and French in the film may be understood only through auditory coding and the overall context (unless they can speak or understand either or both of these languages). As a result, one could wonder if viewers of a subtitled version can always distinguish between the many languages presented on the screen. This might depend on how well known these languages are. British viewers might be fairly capable of distinguishing between French and Russian in view of their geographical and cultural proximity to France.

However, it's unclear if this holds true for languages that are less recognisable to viewers due to their origins in a different geographical location. For example, in the film *The Syrian Bride*, Arabic is frequently spoken alongside Hebrew, two languages with which European audiences may be unfamiliar; watching a subtitled version of the film may take a long time before becoming aware of the difference between these two Semitic languages. As Heiss appropriately remarks: *"One should not underestimate the risk that people will simply overlook cultural differences when being presented with nothing but single-language subtitles"* (Heiss, 2004, p. 215). If subtitles do a

pretty good job of preserving lingua-cultural identities at the level of the soundtrack (i.e. acoustically), it does not mean they do so at the level of the verbal code as well. As (Cronin, 2009, p. 106) confirms: *“Reading the subtitles, the spectator vicariously translates the linguistic multiplicity of the planet into a familiar idiom”*. This “familiar idiom” is obviously the viewer’s own mother tongue. As a result, *“[v]ehicular matching in subtitles, where the subtitles may code-switch alongside the dialogue, is extremely rare.”* (O’Sullivan, 2011, p. 190).

Subtitling strategies in multilingual films

Translators deal with translation challenges by implementing certain strategies, which *“are ways in which translators seek to conform to norms”* (Chesterman, 1997, p. 88). As far as subtitling is concerned, there are different strategies that can be employed in order to deal with the transfer from the Source Text (ST) into the Target Text (TT). For the purpose of subtitling audiovisual films, (Díaz Cintas & Remael, 2007), and (Santamaria Guinot, 2001) propose the following 11 strategies:

- (1) A *loan* occurs when the identical ST word or phrase is utilized in the TT. This may apply to certain beverages or culinary specialties; for instance, the term *“strudel”*, a traditional dessert from German and Austrian cuisine, is preserved in the TT.
- (2) A *calque* refers to a direct translation of a word or expression. For instance, a character references a *“Mexican standoff”*, which is subtitled as *“tablas mexicanas”*. This expression refers to a confrontation between two opponents, presenting a cryptic solution for the target audience, who may not fully understand the reference.

- (3) *Explicitation* involves enhancing the accessibility of the subtitled text for the target audience by employing a hyponym (a term with a more particular connotation) or a hypernym (a term with a more general connotation) to clarify the reference. In one analyzed case, the French ST presents the noun phrase *sa femme et ses enfants* [his wife and his children], which is translated in the TT as the hypernym *su familia* [his family].
- (4) *Substitution* represents a form of explicitation and is a common strategy employed in subtitling. The method is applicable when spatial limitations prevent the inclusion of a long term in the subtitle, despite the existence of such a term in the target language. An instance of substitution is evident in the German dialogue, where the term *Begleiter* (escort) has replaced *pareja* (date), as the Spanish noun is shorter than the more accurate translation, *acompañante*.
- (5) Transposition occurs when an object from one culture gets replaced by another from a different culture. For instance, the idiomatic term "before we get into who shot John" has been translated into Spanish as "*no me vengas con historias*" [don't come to me with stories].
- (6) *Lexical recreation* (LR) involves the creation of a neologism, which is deemed acceptable in the TL, particularly when a character invents the term in the ST. In a dialogue exchange, one character uses the noun phrase "*doggy doc*," which has been subtitled as "*curachuchos*" [mongrel doc], a term entirely fabricated in the TT.
- (7) *Compensation* is a prevalent technique in subtitling that involves offsetting a translational loss at a specific moment in the audiovisual program by augmenting some aspects in the translation at another time in the TT. An illustration of this method is evident in the English phrase *now, as far as your paesanos*, where the Italian term *paesanos* [villagers] has been subtitled as *italianinis*, a Spanish pejorative noun for Italians. The solution emphasizes the poor portrayal of Italians depicted in the film.

- (8) The omission of specific components of the message is unavoidable due to the technical constraints of the medium. Subtitlers must identify essential plot information to retain in the TT and distinguish it from superficial details that may be omitted.
- (9) *Addition* serves as a form of explicitation, particularly when a cultural reference may be unfamiliar to target viewers, necessitating an explanation to ensure comprehension of the concept. This strategy is infrequently employed in subtitling due to its requirement to lengthen the TT. An instance of addition is evident in the translation of the English sentence "*we only got a deal, we trust each other,*" which is rendered in the TT as "*Sólo hay trato si hay confianza*" [There is only a deal if there is trust]. The conjunction "*if*" has been incorporated into the TT, establishing a relationship between the two clauses and enhancing the overall smooth of the TT's reading.
- (10) *Condensation* implies a partial reduction of the text, whereas
- (11) *Reformulation*, according to (Talaván, 2011), is employed to articulate something differently. The manner in which a subtitler condenses and rephrases statements is contingent upon the anticipated reading pace of the audience. There is no universal technique for addressing condensation or reformulation; however, the final outcome should be idiomatic. An illustration of the amalgamation of these two techniques is seen in the statement, *but what else are we gonna do, go home?* translated as *pero no vamos a irnos* [but we are not going to go]. It is evident that condensing has occurred, as certain parts, such as "*else*" or "*home*," have been omitted from the subtitle, yet the core message has been effectively conveyed through reformulation.

According to (O'Sullivan, 2011, p. 192), the use of various fonts (bold, italics) or colors in subtitles can be a reasonable option of signalling the different linguistic and cultural identities on the screen, as it was already quite common practice in the

field of accessible television with teletext subtitles for the deaf and hard-of-hearing. In this respect, the Italian theatrical version of Alejandro González Iñárritu's film *Biutiful* (Alejandro González Iñárritu, 2010) has adopted a similar strategy as the original Spanish version (De Higes Andino, 2014) by implementing distinct coloured subtitles for each of the film's auxiliary languages, cyan for Chinese and yellow for Wolof. This choice was made exclusively for the big screen version, as the Italian DVD, like the Spanish one, has no sign of colored subtitles.

Many filmmakers in recent years are heading to deal with translation from the first steps of the production process and/or to collaborate with translators, partly because of the emergence of multilingual films, , as is the case of Jim Jarmusch (*"Mystery Train"* 1989; *"Night on Earth"* 1991), John Sayles (*"Lone Star"* 1996; *"Men with Guns"* 1997), Charlie Kaufman (*"Synecdoche, New York"* 2008), Danny Boyle (*"Slumdog Millionaire"* 2008), James Cameron (*"Avatar"* 2009), Wim Wenders (*"The Salt of the Earth"* 2014) and, more notoriously, Quentin Tarantino (*"Inglourious Basterds"* 2009) and Alejandro González Iñárritu (*"Babel"* 2009; *"The Revenant"* 2015), both of them gave translation instructions to their distributors in order to guarantee that their films' visions were preserved in the translated versions (Sanz Ortega, 2015). However, because of the rigid nature of commercial subtitling, where distributors have the authority to reject prominent filmmakers' translation alternatives, such as Ken Loach and Quentin Tarantino, independent filmmaking offers an ideal platform to promote Accessible Filmmaking (AFM). Recent films that have integrated translation prior to distribution are good examples, such as Michael Chanan's *"Secret City"* (2012), Enrica Colusso's *"Home Sweet Home"* (2012), Elisa Fuksas' *"Nina"* (2012), Deben Van Dam's *"De weg van alle vlees"* (2013), Álvaro Longoria's *"Hijos de las Nubes"* (2012) or the award-winning Spanish films *"Matria"* (Gago 2017) and *"Estiu"* 1993 (Simón 2017).

Babel

The movie's title is taken from the story of Tower of Babel mentioned in Bible, King James Version, chapter XI /page six of Old Testament where the case of Babel is written:

"1 And the whole earth was of one language, and of one speech.

2 And it came to pass, as they journeyed from the east, that they found a plain in the land of Shinar; and they dwelt there.

3 And they said one to another, Go to, let us make brick, and burn them thoroughly. And they had brick for stone, and slime had they for mortar.

4 And they said, Go to, let us build us a city, and a tower, whose top may reach unto heaven; and let us make us a name, lest we be scattered abroad upon the face of the whole earth".

The Tower of Babel is a classical story of mankind's fate: man's arrogance in claiming to be as powerful as God, followed by God's judgment and curse to remind us that we are merely human. This form of divine retribution may be the cause of an interminable existential struggle for humanity.

The film, directed by Alejandro González Iñárritu in 2006, comprises four interwoven stories. A villager in Morocco purchases a weapon from a Japanese businessman to defend his sheep against jackals. Nevertheless, his kid shoots at a tourist bus, wounding an American tourist named Susan (Cate Blanchett). Richard (Brad Pitt), her husband, needs medical care, which he can only obtain from the locals. The Mexican nanny of Susan and Richard's children in San Diego travels to Mexico for her son's wedding, accompanied by the children. Conversely, the

aforementioned Japanese man has a deaf-mute daughter in distress following her mother's suicide. Babel is a genuine multilingual film, featuring English, Arabic, Berber, Spanish, and Japanese languages. These four languages represent four civilizations that articulated with one another but did not recognize one another reciprocally. Iñárritu's version is post-apocalyptic, re-examining the peril of cultural variety through Babel confusion.

Character	Arabic Dialogue	English script
Anwar	هذا هو الطبيب	"This is the doctor"
Local Doctor	السلام عليكم	Al Salamu Alaikum
Local Doctor	الرصاصه لم تلمس العمود الفقري ولكن لو ظلت هكذا ستنزف حتى الموت	"The bullet didn't hit her spine or split her jugular. But it did shatter her clavicle and she could bleed to death"
Local Doctor (to Anwar)	أخبره انه يجب علي ان اخيط الجرح حتى يتوقف النزيف	"Tell him I have to stitch up the wound to stop the bleeding."
Local Doctor (to Anwar)	أخبره ان عظمة الترقوة لديها مكسورة ويجب ان يضع جبيرة عليها	"And tell him her clavicle is broken. We have to fasten a splint to it"

The present paper investigates the subtitling process in this movie as has been displayed on *Cinemana Application*. The researcher reviews the strategies used in the subtitling process for the part related to the Arabic and English pair in the film.

The researcher finds that there is no clue in the *Babel* film's subtitling showing that this film is a multilingual one. The subtitling language is written in Arabic along the four stories. No different font or colour is used to show that the language spoken is not English.

It is very important to add here that the Arabic spoken in the film's part that taken place in Morocco is not the standard Arabic but the Moroccan dialect, or Berber, but is subtitled to standard Arabic. Regarding this issue, (Rizzo, 2018, p. 93) suggests that:

"there are some strategies and devices that may transfer linguistic variety, which is present in multilingual films (in particular on immigration), are varied and can be applied on different levels: on a typographical level (i.e. the use of different colours, capital letters, Italics), on a technical level (the use of non-standard position of subtitles on screen), on a lexical level (the use of a non-standard terminology, the maintenance of foreign words, phrases and sentences, signs of exoticism), on a grammatical and morphological level (mistakes in the subtitled language, mislearned expressions and vocabulary and misunderstanding of culture-bound terms, mispronunciation in the written text)".

On the other hand, traditionally, culturally and linguistically different territories are places where individual existence problems are more frankly defined. Hence, North Africa deserts are significant places in modern existentialist literature and cinema in this context. After all, everyone survives in their own language.

Conclusion

Multilingualism is a culture. It has been effective from Sumerians to the European Union, from the Old Testament to Renaissance text production, from

literature to cinema. It is an interdisciplinary field that offers rich research opportunities. Multicompetence and multilingualism are seen as having evolved a cultural sensitivity to a variety of diverse linguistic situations—they are at the heart of ongoing study in a variety of fields that are becoming increasingly sensitive to multilingual occurrences (see (Franceschini, 2011, p. 351)). Multilingualism is a linguistic policy that defines our global and post- colonial world. Multilingualism has creative effects on both mainstream and alternative cinemas. Multilingual movies have brought a new category within contemporary cinema, and this movie genre is a *sui generis* cinematic aesthetic context; each director who works in this area has developed it according to his or her own style. The multilingualism of a film is not just a subject matter, but an aesthetic quality specific to cinema language.

References

- Aronin, L., & Laoine, M. (2013). The Material Culture of Multilingualism: Moving beyond the Linguistic Landscape. *International Journal of Multilingualism*, 3(10), pp. 225– 235.
- Atay, S. (2019). Multilingualism and Cinema. *European Journal of Applied Linguistics Studies*, 1(2), pp. 140–163.
- Bleichenbacher, L. (2008). *Multilingualism in the Movies. Hollywood Characters and Their Language Choices*. Franke Verlag.
- Campari, R. (1983). *Il racconto del film. Generi, personaggi, immagini [Film Narration. Genres, Characters, Images]*. Laterza.
- Cenoz, J. (2013). Defining Multilingualism. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*(33), pp. 3–18.

- Chatman, S. (1978). *Story and Discourse. Narrative Structure in Fiction and Film*. Cornell University Press.
- Chesterman, A. (1997). *Memes of Translation. The Spread of Ideas in Translation Theory*. Benjamins.
- Cronin, M. (2009). *Translation Goes to the Movies*. Routledge.
- De Bonis, G. (2015). Translating multilingualism in film: A case study on *Le concert*. *New Voices in Translation Studies*(12), pp. 50–71.
- De Higes Andino, I. (2014). The Translation of Multilingual Films: Modes, Strategies, Constraints and Manipulation in the Spanish Translations of *It's a Free World*. *Linguistica Antverpiensia*(13), pp. 211–231.
- Derrida, J. (1985). *Des Tours de Babel*. In J. Graham, *Difference in Translation*. Cornell University Press.
- Díaz Cintas, J., & Remael, A. (2007). *Audiovisual Translation: Subtitling*. St. Jerome.
- Dwyer, T. (2005). Universally Speaking: Lost in Translation and Polyglot Cinema. *Linguistica Antverpiensia, New Series—Temes in Translation Studies*(4), pp. 295–310.
- Franceschini, R. (2011). Multilingualism and Multicompetence: A Conceptual View. *MLJ The Modern Language Journal*, 3(95), pp. 344–355. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/41262371>
- Harshav, B. (2011). Language: Multilingualism. In *YIVO Encyclopedia of Jews in Eastern Europe*.
- Heiss, C. (2004). Dubbing a New Challenge? *Meta: Translator's Journal*, 1(49), pp. 208–220.

- Kaminsky, S. (1985). *American Film Genres. Approaches to a Critical Theory of Popular Film*. Wadsworth Pub. Co. .
- Knauth, K. A. (2009). Literary Multilingualism I: General Outlines and Western World. In L. Block de Behar, P. Mildonian, J.-M. D, A. D. Kadir, A. Knauth, D. Romero Lopez, & M. Seligmann Silva, *Comparative Literature: Sharing Knowledges for Preserving Cultural Diversity Volume III Encyclopedia of Life Support Systems, Unesco* (pp. 41-64). Eolss.
- Moore, D., & Gajo, L. (2009). French voices on plurilingualism and pluriculturalism: Theory,significance and perspectives. *International Journal of Multilingualism*(6), pp. 137-153. doi:10.1 080/ 1 479071 090284670
- O'Sullivan, C. (2007). Multilingualism at the Multiplex: A New Audience for Screen Translation? *Linguistica Antverpiensia, New Series—Themes in Translation Studies*(6), pp. 81-95.
- O'Sullivan, C. (2007). Multilingualism at the Multiplex: A New Audience for Screen Translation? . *Linguistica Antverpiensia, New Series—Themes in Translation Studies*, pp. 81-95.
- O'Sullivan, C. (2011). *Translating Popular Film*. Palgrave Macmillan.
- Rizzo, A. (2018). Somers Town. Multilingual settings explored in audiovisual translation contexts. *Cultus: the Journal of intercultural mediation and communication*, 2(10), pp. 93-111. Retrieved from http://www.cultusjournal.com/files/Archives/Cultus_10_2_Rizzo-A
- Santamaria Guinot, L. (2001). Culture and translation. The referential and expressive value of cultural references. In F. Chaume Varela, & R. Agost Canós, *La traducción en los medios audiovisuales* (pp. 159-164). Universitat Jaume I.

- Sanz Ortega, E. (2015). *Beyond Monolingualism: A Descriptive and Multimodal Methodology for the Dubbing of Polyglot Films*. The University of Edinburgh and The University of Granada.
- Talaván, N. (2011). A Quasi-Experimental Research Project on Subtitling and Foreign Language Acquisition. In L. Incalcaterra McLoughlin, M. Biscio, & M. Á. Ní Mhainnín, *Subtitles and Subtitling. Theory and Practice* (pp. 197–218). Peter Lang.
- Vanoye, F. (1985). Conversations publiques. [Public Conversations]. (F. Vanoye, Ed.) *La Parole au Cinéma [Speech in Film], Special Issue of Iris, 3.1: , 1(3)*, pp. 99–118.
- Wahl, C. (2005). Discovering a Genre: The Polyglot Film. *Cinemascope 1: Translating the Cinematic Experience Across Cultures*, pp. 1–8.
- Whorf, B. L. (1940). Science and linguistics. *MIT Technology Review*(42), pp. 229–31. Retrieved from http://en.wikiquote.org/wiki/Benjamin_Lee_Whorf
- Yannic, A. (2010). Francophonie, plurilinguisme, traduction: La mondialization des enjeux identitaires. *Hermès*, pp. 29–34.

Filmography

Babel (Alejandro González Iñárritu, 2006, France, USA, Mexico): Arabic, Berber, English, French, Japanese, Japanese Sign Language, Spanish.