Al-Adab Journal Issue. No (154) Supplement (September) 2025
E-ISSN: 2706-9931 P-ISSN: 1994-473X

Violence and Refugees: A Study in Eve Ensler's Necessary Targets

Ghadeer Adel Abbas
Master's student in Dep. of English, College of Arts/ University of Baghdad
ghadeer.adel2203m@coart.uobaghdad.edu.iq

Dr. Alyaa Abdulhussein Naser
(Ph.D. University of Sheffield, UK)
General Secretary of the College of Arts Board
Instructor of English Literature, History, Humanities, and Language
Dep. of English, College of Arts/ University of Baghdad
alyaanaser@coart.uobaghdad.edu.iq

DOI: https://doi.org/10.31973/t0xk4n41

Abstract:

Eve Ensler's play *Necessary Targets* (1996) dramatises how violence in Bosnia must be understood within the context of epistemic violence exercised by the ideological apparatuses of the Western powers. The play suggests that the dominant system of knowledge represents the Bosnian refugees as primitive to silence them and to maintain the superiority of the West. Using Johan Galtung's typology of violence, this research article investigates the forms of violence endured by women refugees in Bosnia. Galtung introduces three types of violence: direct violence, structural violence, and cultural violence. The research article also highlights the conception of violence as a self-perpetuating cycle to explore the possibility of breaking it.

Keywords: Bosnian, Ensler, Galtung, Refugees, Violence,

E-ISSN: 2706-9931 P-ISSN: 1994-473X

I. An Introduction

Johan Galtung, a Norwegian sociologist, is best known for his theory of the "Violence Triangle", in which he refers to "peace" as the "absence of violence" (Galtung, 1969, p. 168). In his article "Violence, Peace, and Peace Research", Galtung introduces two types of violence: direct and structural. Direct violence, or personal violence, is the type of violence in which there is a subject to commit violence. It is visible as an action with a clear subject-object relation. Without this relation, violence is structural. Structural violence, or indirect violence, is the type of violence in which there is no subject to commit the violence; the violence is "built into the structure and shows up as unequal power and consequently as unequal life chances" (Galtung, 1969, p. 171). In 1990, Galtung introduces a further type of violence, cultural violence, defining it as any aspect of culture– exemplified by language, ideology, arts, religion, and science– that can be used to legitimise or justify violence in its structural or direct forms. Cultural violence works by making reality opaque or by rendering the act of violence from appearing wrong to seeming right or at least acceptable (Galtung, pp. 291-292).

Eve Ensler, a playwright, performer, poet, screenwriter, author, and activist, was born in New York 1953 and raised up in Scarsdale. The emotional wound of her father's sexual assault creates turmoil in her adult life, influencing her writing and inspiring her to begin V-Day, a global movement aiming to stop violence against all women worldwide (Toft, 2013, p. 1). She justifies her interest in theatre to her carving "a sense of community". She elaborates further to state that, "what this event is all about. If nothing else, it has brought women together" (Getlin, 1998, p. 1). She is a recipient of many significant awards, including the Isabelle Stevenson Tony Award, the Lilly Award, and many honorary degrees.

Feminism, for Ensler, does not promote female supremacy but rather egalitarianism. It entails women enjoying all the rights afforded to men, an aspiration delineated in her writings. In the chapter entitled "I Still Don't Get How You Could Put a Leash on a Human Being", Ensler points out that feminism means "reconstructing the world so that the mechanisms of dominance and violence are not the controlling factors. Rather than creating hierarchies based on abuse and submission, we would be creating partnerships based on equality and empowerment" (Ensler, 2007, p.18). Though many feminists see women as perpetual victims and men as perpetual executioners, Ensler thinks that women are capable of torturing and committing evil acts. However, in most cases, they engage in offensive behaviours as an

E-ISSN: 2706-9931 P-ISSN: 1994-473X

outlet for the outrage that results from being abused. Their hearts are numbed, and their ability to sympathise is damaged. They feel that they must prove themselves and regain some of their self-esteem by humiliating others. On the other hand, many victims devote their lives to ending violence and continuous abuse (Ensler, 2007, pp. 18-19).

Her major plays often focus on feminist issues, marginalisation, and female empowerment. The suffering of raped women and incest victims is prevalent in her works as she seeks to end criminal, domestic, and cultural violence against women. Ensler's Necessary Targets (1996) mainly examines the atrocity of the war and the trepidation inflicted upon refugee women, based on her interview with survivors in the Bosnian refugee camps.

In 1993, Ensler traveled to former Yugoslavia to meet Bosnian women refugees who were forced to deal with the atrocities of the civil war, and their stories inspired her to write Necessary Targets. "It was their community, their holding on to love, their insane humanity in the face of catastrophe, their staggering refusal to have or seek revenge," she states, "that fueled me and ultimately moved me to write this play" (Ensler, 2001, p. xiv).

The play was premiered at the Hartford Stage, Connecticut in 2001. A year later, The Variety Arts Theater in New York hosted the play where it was performed for fifty four days. In her review of the play, Karen Bovard states that it is different from Ensler's other well-known plays; it does not depend on stylistic innovation or heightened language as it does not aim to add artistic value. Bovard further adds, "In the array of options about how to make art about trauma without exploitation or retraumatization, Necessary Targets represents a mainstream choice: naturalistic character-based drama" (Bovard, 2002, p. 643).

Necessary Targets offers a portrayal of a group of Bosnian women refugees who endured wartime violence and explores the physical and psychological ramifications they experience. In her play, Ensler presents examples of women from different cultural backgrounds and social and economic statuses brought together by war in one camp. Using Galtung's terminology of violence, in Necessary Targets, direct violence may be stoppable, while structural violence is more challenging to halt, a point echoed in the play through seventeen short scenes depicting the psychological problems women face and the defence mechanisms they use during their encounters with the therapists.

E-ISSN: 2706-9931 P-ISSN: 1994-473X

The play begins with a tense meeting between the psychiatrist J.S., sent by the American president, and MELISSA, a trauma counsellor who works with "seriously traumatized populations" (2001, p. 8), discussing their travel to Bosnia to meet "the women war refugees" (2001, p. 11). The events unfold with the refugees, consisting of five women: JELENA, ZLATA, SEADA, AZRA, and NUNA, each carrying a different story of her experience with violence. The Bosnian refugees initially do not disclose personal details due to distrust of the American therapists and resort to derision.

ZLATA. You flew all the way here for that? Two American doctors to 'help' a group of poor Bosnian refugees talk about the war? What did you think we were talking about before you came? Our lingerie, our dinner parties…

NUNA. No, our face-lifts… .(2001, pp. 31-32)

The direct violence experienced by the Bosnian women is manifested through direct actions perpetrated by Christians against them as Muslims and as men against women, children, and the elderly, ranging from threats, beatings, rape, and murder to forced displacement from their lands. Suppose women suffer injustice, violence, and persecution during times of peace, in that case, they suffer even more during wars as the weakest element, along with children, making them suitable targets due to their vulnerability, as well as for other reasons, including racial, political, and religious factors.

As Galtung elucidates, the threat of violence is violence as well. Intending to intimidate the other party by threatening them materially or psychologically and instilling terror in them to execute the criminal's desired outcome is violence by itself. The use of physical, authoritative, military, or financial force to subdue the other party by threatening to deprive them of their possessions or hurting them has a profoundly negative impact on both physical and psychological human health because "the destruction of things [is] a foreboding or threat of possible destruction of persons" (Galtung, 1969, p. 170). In the Bosnian war, threats are prevalent; as AZRA recounts, she was threatened to leave her land, after which they seized her farm and stole her animals, leading her to suffer from cultural bereavement. Consequently, she becomes melancholic and experiences frequent crying spells. AZRA is particularly attached to her cow, as it symbolises nourishment and abundance to rural people:

E-ISSN: 2706-9931 P-ISSN: 1994-473X

AZRA. They threatened me for months, but I would not go. I am thick, tough. I decided if they were going to kill me, they'd only kill me once. Then they broke into my house_ they stole my cow. (2001, p. 52)

As for murder, it is another aspect of direct violence that is particularly prevalent in wars. People have been inflicted with wounds that do not heal in their memories after witnessing these massacres. They saw their family members being brutally slaughtered before their eyes. The American psychiatrist, James Gilligan, remarks that "actions that do not directly cause physical injury or death can constitute the kind of psychological torture that can destroy a human personality in ways that are likely to lead to violent behavior" (Gilligan, 1997, p. 49). While the women in the play may not have been directly killed, witnessing these horrific scenes has remained ingrained in their minds and caused them psychological traumas. This is portrayed in SEADA when she witnessed the killing of her mother and husband.

NUNA. They tried to take Seada. Her mother and her husband put up a fight and they shot them just like that, both of them right there, right in the head. Seada saw this happen. (2001, p. 96)

Similarly, men who were not fatally harmed but witnessed murder were also affected in their behaviours towards others. This includes increased harshness in dealing with their wives. Their rates of aggressive behaviour escalated due to witnessing bloody violence and killing, as was the case with Dado, who witnessed the brutal killing and dismemberment of his brother and father.

JELENA. [Dado] started screaming about not taking him outside, the knives, how he'd do anything, not to hurt him, not to hurt the others- his father, that was his father and brother, to stop with the knives, stop carving his father, his fingers, his chest, his father. To stop. And he started begging, crying like a little boy. (2001, p. 87)

Given that violence breeds violence in a continuous cycle that is difficult to break, like a closed loop with no beginning or end, it is found that the violence experienced by Dado recurred, and he engaged in it by physically abusing his wife, JELENA. Being oppressed by her husband, who represents the patriarchy, and the institution of war, JELENA becomes "doubly in shadow" (Spivak, 1994, p. 84). She is doubly oppressed by those two authorities that aim to deny her agency and individuality. In their discussion about the negative effects of wars on the domestic and social lives of people, Basaad Mhayyal and Haitham Al-Zubbaidi (2022) state that: "people start behaving in a violent way towards each other as well as towards themselves. They

E-ISSN: 2706-9931 P-ISSN: 1994-473X

use violence as a reaction to the difficulties they face and the oppression of the authorities" (p. 644). Dado indeed violated his wife after he faced the oppression of the soldiers. He has transformed from a "tender" (2001, p. 41) person into a "new mutation of war" (2001, p. 87). However, his reaction follows a patriarchal mentality in which men are associated with "transcendence" while women are confined to "immanence".1 He believes that he and JELENA should not be at an equal status in which they are both passive. That is to say, Dado attempts to transcend his humiliation by asserting dominance over JELENA, ultimately keeping her in a state of immanence, bound by traditional and oppressive gender roles.

Perhaps one of the most terrifying incidents that NUNA witnessed was the dilemma she faced being of mixed parentage as her father and mother belong to different ethnicities. She witnessed a mixed-race soldier killing his mother to prove allegiance to his father's side. This violence was driven by deep-seated racial discrimination within some people's psyches. This discrimination implanted a ferocity within this soldier, who trampled upon his human emotions, enabling him to kill the woman who raised him up from infancy to adulthood. If anything, this indicates an increase in cruelty and hatred during wars; "NUNA. There was a soldier who was half-and-half like me. He slit his own mother's throat to prove to the army that he was one of them" (2001, p. 74).

In the Bosnian war, rape was "part of a deliberate, carefully planned tactical military operation within the strategy of ethnic cleansing" (Kesic, 2001, p. 24). Jennifer Turpin argues that the mass rape of women is related to the patriarchal definition of ethnicity. When a Serb soldier rapes a woman, the child would be a Serb, inheriting the ethnicity of his father; and since the mother is the symbol of the family, and the family, in turn, is the bases of the society, giving birth to the enemy's child represents the demolition of the community (Turpin, 1998, p. 5).

[1] The terms "transcendence" and "immanence" are used by the French feminist Simone de Beauvoir to refer to the male and the female's statures in human tradition. Males have been able to find self-realisation as existent individuals and transcend their environment in terms of projecting their lives, while immanence is related to the Otherness of females who have never been able to act their own in life; rather, they find themselves restricted in their immanence, remaining confined within the structured feminine traits of passivity, submissiveness, and dependence and imprisoned within the circle of duties imposed by their maternal functions.

E-ISSN: 2706-9931 P-ISSN: 1994-473X

The play vividly depicts the horrific suffering endured by Bosnian women during the ethnic war; in addition to the mentioned instances, women suffer brutal massive rape. The scene where SEADA admits being raped by the soldiers is one of the most impactful scenes of the play, it is likely owing to the playwright Ensler's own experience of repeated rape during her childhood. The scene is poignant, portraying the details experienced by the character of SEADA, a young and beautiful nursing mother whose husband and mother attempted to defend her but failed as they were killed by the offenders.

The motive behind the rape is not solely sexual but also rooted in repugnant racial reasons. The rapists perceive themselves as superior to the victim, believing that raping her would produce better offspring. Therefore, the act of rape is a form of double violence, as it does not only involve physical violence. In addition to the brutality of the rapists and the psychological pain with lasting effects they cause, they also commit verbal violence aimed at diminishing the victim's worth and humiliating her, reinforcing their own superiority and devaluing her and her people;

SEADA. My aching breasts hungry to feed, overflowing with milk for Doona, as they tear off my blouse, these loud, laughing voices wearing black masks, stinking of shit and meat, tear off my milk-stained blouse and rip at my aching, full breasts, biting them, sucking, 'Okay, Mommy, I'll be your little, dirty baby'- as the other one spreads my legs and the other holds my arms- Doona- 'we'll show you how to make real babies, real clean babies. We'll fill you with the right kind of babies.' Then he shoves himself into me, and there is a tearing, a ripping, the center of my dress, my underpants, splitting me apart, and as I'm splitting I can hear her suddenly, hear her crying out for her mother. (2001, p. 104)

Eve Ensler most likely selects this experience to be told in the "present tense" to magnify the terrible impact of this act and how it can never be in the "past" for the victim. As a rape survivor Ensler says in her meeting with a group of women that "most people don't have a clue what rape does.. rape is seizing something.. and dominating something that is not yours.. [As a victim] you recover from rape your entire life. It is not a moment; it is a destiny" (Ensler, 2012, 0:40-1:35). If the intention is to gain the audience's sympathy for such violence, then AZRA's experience is the complete opposite. She recounts her experience, saying, "One of the boys who beat me with a stick- I breast-fed him when he was an infant, when his mother was too sick" (2001, p. 95). This may lead the audience to be critical

E-ISSN: 2706-9931 P-ISSN: 1994-473X

and alert as they already know that AZRA has "never had a man" (2001, p. 49), bringing the play temporarily close to Brechtian epic theatre in which the audience is intended to participate in criticising the characters and the situations (Mambrol, 2019, para. 4).

These violent experiences endured by the characters in the play lead to violent reactions towards themselves first and then towards others. Smoking and alcohol are two types of self-harm, albeit superficially acting as a means to alleviate stress. Self-mutilation also becomes evident in the case of SEADA as she attempts self-injury after overhearing the women talking about the loss of her infant daughter, Doona. As a mother, she banishes this traumatic event from her consciousness, thinking the bundle of rags she carries is her child. This reminder of an unbearable event for any mother triggers a hysterical reaction. She is depicted digging into the earth and pulling her hair, as she recalls memories of her rape, her escape from the soldiers, and the loss of her little daughter. Feeling guilty might be the reason behind her behaviours; she holds herself responsible for the loss of her child. Alternatively, Such behaviours are not meant to be a punishment but rather a stimulus to actualise physical sensations because feeling physical pain is the only way to feel alive, and it is preferred to feel pain than to feel nothing. Noelle B. Smith et al. (2014) state that in coping with trauma symptoms, self-harm sometimes serves as a means to escape intrusive memories or thoughts or to induce feelings during periods of numbing and dissociation (p. 41). The symbolism of the loss of the child signifies the loss of an entire generation in the torment of war, their fate and their unknown future.

Similarly, AZRA's action of burying herself in a large hole in the ground and desiring death. One of the main causes of suicidal ideation is hopelessness (Rabani et al., 2020, p. 1329). AZRA has lost hope in life or returning to her homeland, describing herself as "ugly and old" (2001, p. 82); such behaviours indicate a violent attitude towards herself and an attempt to escape from the accumulated pain and psychological torment she endures.

The cycle of violence entrenches itself in the minds of the victims, who sometimes practise it on smaller beings upon which they can vent their anger and frustration, even if they deny that:

NUNA. Yes, she heard how you kicked your dog.

AZRA. I did not kick Tessa. I love Tessa more than I love most of you. (2001, p. 24)

E-ISSN: 2706-9931 P-ISSN: 1994-473X

At times, they turn to the two American women as outlets to release their irritation by mocking their work and their seemingly unhelpful presence, which MELISSA feels after waves of rejection from the refugees at the beginning of the play; “MELISSA. These women need an outlet for their rage and despair. We are necessary targets” (2001, p. 39).

If women do not engage in reactive or reciprocal violence or reenact the violence they have experienced, then violent thoughts take root in their minds. If given the opportunity to be manifested in concrete form, they would be materialised in a very grotesque manner. ZLATA, for instance, assumes that a “monster” resides within every individual, waiting to be unleashed. Each has his own “ugliness” and motives for violence. In her conversation with J.S., who admits that she cannot stand those who apologise all the time or those who interrupt speakers, ZLATA asks J.S. to “Shoot them at once” (2001, p. 62). Even if it is said as a joke, jokes are not always innocent (Freud, 1963, p. 92); they are sometimes expressions of “veiled hostility” (Finkel, 2017, p. 105).

The women employ many methods to relieve sorrow, such as dance. However, all those methods afford them solace and comfort for a temporary period. Dancing is probably meant not only to be an outlet for the characters but also for the audience. In drama, dancing is sometimes performed for two psychological purposes: to provide the audience with an outlet and to entertain them (Nasser, 2006, p. 138). JELENA, following the physical harm inflicted by her husband, seeks consolation in dancing under the stars. SEADA also has her unique experiences with nature; she feels safe when the sun’s rays caress her face, asking the therapists to record this blissful communion. She also disrobes during her dance as if she desires to fully immerse herself in the natural world and break free from societal constraints. These moments of transient relief assume both carnivalesque and matriarchal characteristics. With the aid of alcohol and singing, women enjoy oneness with nature. Immersing in nature is linked to the concept of the feminine divine that characterises matriarchal societies (Eyers, 2022, paras. 3-10). The women’s unity with the natural world is exemplified in several scenes, such as when the Bosnian women enjoy dangling their toes in the river. Nevertheless, these instants of tranquillity vanish due to the intrusion of war memories and the harsh realities of their present circumstances.

E-ISSN: 2706-9931 P-ISSN: 1994-473X

Since "Matriarchies are societies that place the highest value on the aspects of nurture, care and generosity usually associated with motherhood" (Eyers, 2022, para. 3), the women often support one another. ZLATA, notably, cures J.S. after her "Bosnian heat rash" affliction by applying ointment to her neck and arms. However, such support may manifest in mistaken behaviours, such as Bosnians falsely pretending that SEADA's daughter is still alive in an attempt to offer condolence, leaving her to believe her illusions. As for the Americans, J.S. assumes a maternal role towards SEADA, who loses awareness of herself as a mature being, seeking refuge in J.S's bed. After initial resistance, J.S. eventually relents and accepts SEADA's dependence. J.S. "ignores the traditional boundary between doctor and patient and forms with Seada an image of female-only pieta" (Morales, 2005, p. 14). In contrast, as an outsider to the matriarchal system, MELISSA does not elicit a comparable sense of protection or safety for the refugees. During SEADA's panic attack, she lets out a piercing scream, believing that MELISSA is a soldier.

Structural violence takes centre stage in the play, upsetting the characters' thoughts and feelings. This form of violence, as articulated by Galtung, is an ongoing violence that does not lead to death but rather deprives individuals of their basic needs and thus shortens their lifespan. It encompasses various aspects, including deprivation of well-being needs, restriction of freedoms and rights, and loss of value and belonging.

The freedom of mobility is ultimately denied within the refugee camp. The refugees are almost imprisoned within it due to the war, unable to return to their lands. While the camp may be a safe place, it is also a geographic area where all the tragedies and pains experienced by the war victims converge. It is a contaminated area, and a slow death awaits its inhabitants due to the repercussions that will not stop at a specific limit but are wide-ranging, affecting future generations and extending over decades. Freedom of movement is non-existent, and this has made the refugee women see themselves as akin to sardine cans:

JELENA. Have you ever noticed a sardine? It's not a fish, really. It's a thing that grows in a can. It no longer has any connection to being alive. It hardly remembers sun or sky or water. Covered in oil, in scum. It survives on the memory of all these things. It survives on the closeness to the other sardines. (2001, p. 70)

Despite the short duration of her stay in the camp, J.S. is troubled by the lack of movement and the stagnant situation. She longs for air to make her feel free and mobile; "J.S.. I need the breeze to sleep, the

E-ISSN: 2706-9931 P-ISSN: 1994-473X

air, the sense of going somewhere" (2001, p. 110). J.S. faces significant challenges in adjusting to the harsh conditions and temporary nature of life in the camp. Accustomed to luxury life and purchasing clothing only from world-renowned brands, she finds it difficult to reconcile her previous lifestyle with the stark realities of her new environment. The near-total absence of luxury and comforts in the camp is a primary source of discomfort and quandary for her.

J.S.. You'll excuse me, but I need the little comforts. You're younger than I. I welcome a bath, clean sheets, and a place to sit to…

MELISSA. Poop. These women need those same comforts. They had them all before the war.

J.S.. I don't think squatting in filthy footprints will make me a more effective therapist. Frankly, I think it will irritate me. I will be less patient and cranky. (2001, pp. 18-19)

Furthermore, they are deprived of some basic human needs, such as physiological needs, safety needs, and belonging needs. This deprivation of needs is evident in several admissions of women. Adequate food, a fundamental need for survival and the continuation of life, and a right of every human being, becomes scarce in times of war. The refugees rely on aid sent to them by sympathetic countries and charitable institutions. This scarcity falls under the umbrella of economic violence directed by powerful forces against the targeted population, either to eliminate and starve them or to subjugate and humiliate them into surrendering to the aggressors' will; "JELENA. I haven't had a fresh vegetable for three months" (2001, p. 71).

The lack of healthy food or its scarcity, as well as the absence of doctors, necessarily contribute to the deterioration of refugees' health conditions, resulting in physical illnesses that afflict women throughout their stay in the camp. The increased number of critical cases and patients often means that not everyone receives suitable medical care:

AZRA. I need a doctor.

ZLATA. She is not that kind of doctor.

AZRA. I'm sure she knows something about arthritis. All doctors know about arthritis. (2001, p. 28)

Belongingness and love needs, such as social interaction with friends, are no less important than material needs, as their loss will inevitably lead to psychological problems. The thwarting of these needs, according to the American psychologist Abraham Maslow, is "the most commonly found core in cases of maladjustment and more severe pathology" (Maslow, 1970, p. 44). While material deficiencies may be overlooked, belongingness needs cannot be disregarded. The

E-ISSN: 2706-9931 P-ISSN: 1994-473X

lack or absence of these human rights is hidden structural violence, where the perpetrator cannot be identified. However, its victims are known, and its evident effects are present.

MELISSA. What are you waiting for?...

NUNA. To talk to my friends on the telephone. (2001, pp. 70-71)

The cultural violence is prominently manifested in the behaviours of the Americanised teenager NUNA, who suffers due to the identity conflict between her parents, as both sides reject her, leading her to lose a sense of belonging to either. At times, she may even feel self-loathing. This young girl does not only represent herself but also a large segment of young people suffering from an identity crisis due to the cultural violence exercised by stronger societies against weaker ones. This violence is practised through various means, most notably through media, both auditory and visual, perpetuating the idea that America is the greatest country while categorising certain countries as third-world nations, deemed less educated, cultured, and economically advanced, thus diminishing their value. Youth are influenced by these notions, leading to self-acceptance struggles and attempts to emulate the stronger and better-off. For NUNA, who is enslaved intellectually, America represents the dream she seeks to explore in its entirety, aiming to satisfy this internal void, especially after experiencing discrimination due to her mixed heritage and not receiving the respect she deserves as a human being.

NUNA. One part of me hates the other part… I dream of them sucking the other half out of me with leeches. But I can never decide which part the other would be, Mommy or Daddy. You ask me what I'm waiting for- I'm waiting for someone to respect me, to see me as their own. (2001, p. 74)

Apparently, identity is something that America makes for her, and by doing that, they commit violence that splits her very sense of self. Therefore, due to her loss of identity and belonging, she tries to imitate the American culture; she also longs to learn more about America and the conditions of its people, as well as their thoughts and behaviours, believing that people there are more cultured and better than them. In several scenes, she would inquire about this from the therapists. For instance, she states, "People in America have facials all the time, don't they? No one has bad skin. Everyone's beautiful and perfect" (2001, p. 72). What NUNA expresses in her various statements and questions throughout the play reflects her sense of inferiority caused by the policies of great powers that solidify an idealised image of themselves and belittle other nations that lag

E-ISSN: 2706-9931 P-ISSN: 1994-473X

behind them in their interests. Ideology is what leads NUNA to feel inferior.

Since Galtung considers misrepresentation as part of cultural violence (Galtung, 1990, p. 300), this invisible type is felt and perceived by the Bosnian refugees, especially when newcomers and visitors, whether doctors or journalists, view them as specimens, patients, or parts of a narrative to be written, without considering them as ordinary humans. What the Bosnian women experienced during the war was not even within their expectations. Therefore, various reactions were resulted in against the American therapists, especially at the beginning of their arrival and their attempt to learn about their stories. Rejecting to be recorded, refusing interaction with the therapists, mocking their arrival, and denying having any psychological problems are different methods of defence mechanisms the refugees employ. These methods also reveal their awareness of the potential for misrepresentation. For the Western powers, misrepresentation becomes a tool for epistemic violence used to reinforce the dominant narratives and silence the counter ones. Epistemic violence is exercised when the "systems of knowledge depend on silencing and alienating subaltern groups in order to normalize and naturalize exploitative systems" (Hume, 2008, p. 60). The prevailing idea of media-driven misrepresentation remained, with many examples illustrating this notion.

ZLATA. you want us to be different than you are so you can convince yourselves it wouldn't happen there, where you are. That's why you turn us into stories, into beasts, Communists, people who live in strange country and speak a strange language- then you can feel safe, superior. Then, afterward, we become freaks, the stories of freaks. (2001, p. 64)

In order to persist in their domination and sovereignty, modern states may need to control the perspectives of people through the indoctrination of ideologies. This minority women group's camp becomes a place for the Western states to exercise power. By casting the refugees as "deranged" (2001, p. 32), they perpetuate the Eurocentrism and their superiority. MELISSA belongs to the state institution and serves to transmit the values and principles of the state. This is evident when she photographs the women enjoying the French aids and intentionally avoids photographing ZLATA as she reads a book (2001, p. 69). It is meant to represent the Bosnian women as primitive; thus, they maintain the established Eurocentric binary oppositions "the self" and "the other". In this case, the play reinforces Spivak's argument that "knowledge is never innocent, it is always

E-ISSN: 2706-9931 P-ISSN: 1994-473X

operated by western economical interest and power" (Ambesange, 2016, p. 48).

A close examination of the events of the play will reveal that violence is not limited to the Bosnian refugees. According to Marta Morales, a scholar of English studies, "cohabitation... makes it possible for privileged Western women like J.S. and Melissa to throw away their masks and reveal their own conflicts and loneliness" (2005, p. 11). The cultural violence affects the two American therapists who come together in an attempt to help the refugees. Imposing the expectation of organisation, assertiveness, and drive on women, mainly when framed as a model of American female success, can be seen as a form of cultural violence. This pressure adds another layer to the spectrum of violence women face worldwide. For instance, J.S.'s father trained her to sing in a coercive manner, causing her psychological trauma. Although she may not perpetrate violence against others, she is acutely aware of the strictness of her work and the rules she sets. Speaking about her father, J.S. says:

The obsessive, driven nature of his training. I am so goddamn well trained. I'm no different than a soldier… Marching through people's brains. I don't murder people, well, I do, really. I kill them with all my boundaries and rules and perfect training…No, I am no longer a person who can sing. I'm trained. I'm a psychiatrist. I'm not sloppy… no, not me. (2001, pp. 77-79)

As for MELISSA, who comes to Bosnia as a companion to J.S. to learn about women's stories for a novel book with a major publisher, she too is pathologically committed to achieving the ideal image of the successful woman, even at the expense of her health and well-being, as she moves from one country to another for this purpose. J.S. realises MELISSA's tribulation and tries to persuade her to stop excessive impulsivity, loosen the rope a little, and not pressure herself.

J.S. Melissa, I said I appreciate your intensity. In fact, I do. You're very brave. You don't waste time. You take charge. I admire that. I admire you. It's just I think sometimes you need to hang back a little. You need to watch, wait. (2001, p. 68)

An intense dialogue is unfolded between the two therapists in which their characters are revealed together, shedding light on the cultural violence they experience. The pursuit of fame and the realisation of the American "I" makes them lead unhealthy lives, panting after the idealised image.

J.S.. This is about you and your hunger for fame..

MELISSA. This isn't about me, J.S. Everything for you is about the I.. the big American, self-centered I…. I think you're jealous. I

E-ISSN: 2706-9931 P-ISSN: 1994-473X

think you would love to be me. I think you're suddenly aware that you waited too long for your life to happen and now you're lonely and old, and you don't know where to begin. (2001, pp. 99-100)

Both J.S. and MELISSA are menticided by the patriarchal society, so they become alienated from their true nature. Menticiding aims to prevent or reduce independent thinking ability by injecting unwanted or new thoughts into the minds of the subjects (Campbell, 2009, p. 602). In the current era, the nature of women's jobs starkly contrasts with the matriarchal epoch, where an external authority did not impose labour directives. J.S. and MELISSA follow and obey patriarchal instructions embodied by the American president and the state institutions. The German socialist philosopher, Frederick Engels, notices that,

The social status of the lady of civilization, surrounded by sham homage and estranged from all real work, is socially infinitely lower than that of the hard-working woman of barbarism, who was regarded among her people as a real lady.. and was such by the nature of her position. (Engels, 1972, p. 82)

The violence experienced by MELISSA obviously breeds a hidden violence towards herself and others. In the preceding dialogue, she exercises verbal violence against J.S. by calling her with hurtful epithets such as "lonely," "old," and "jealous." Her cruelty does not stop there; she also blames the women in the camp, attributing their psychological problems to their silence, accusing them of being the cause of their mental health issues. She suggests that speaking up is the only way for their healing . Evidently, MELISSA's character of being indifferent to the suffering of the refugees, is nothing but a reaction to her past, leading her to focus on publishing her book and achieving success. However, all the violence that MELISSA suffers, manifests itself as violence towards herself. It becomes clear that she neglects her physical health, showing the magnitude of her problems. In the fifteenth scene, J.S. hears MELISSA vomiting in the bathroom (2001, p. 107).

At the end of the play, while MELISSA continues to pursue her dream of success, J.S. is recovering from her organised, professional, affluent life and searching for achievement and recognition as an important American woman. According to Morales, the transformation of J.S., who appears as the playwright's "alter ego", is apparent. Initially, she prefers a distant perspective, prioritising her professional practices over her subjective choices. As the narrative progresses, she is depicted as a "mere voyeur character", watching the tragedy of the refugees from "the outside" without any risk of being

E-ISSN: 2706-9931 P-ISSN: 1994-473X

transformed. Nevertheless, as the bonds of sisterhood become more cordial, J.S. shifts away from "traditional spectatorship... into a more politically committed option: becoming a spect-actor inside the play" (Morales, 2005, p. 11).

J.S. What if this woman, Zlata, her heart were to bleed into mine and I were to hemorrhage, and we were to bleed together?.. And then, what if I were to tell you that I was not unhappy? No, my ambition, my need to achieve, have it, have more, was the thing that made me unhappy. (2001, p. 117)

In his book Peace By Peaceful Means, Galtung explains that conflict occurs due to a clash of interests, misconceptions, and coercive behaviours (Galtung, 1996, p. 7), all of which lead to wars between nations or troubles between individuals. And this is clearly the case in Bosnia, igniting the devastating war that claimed the lives of thousands of innocent people and caused displacement, migration, destruction of buildings and farms, infrastructure collapse, and harm to living beings. According to Galtung, there is "negative peace" and "positive peace". Negative peace ends the war and bloodshed, but positive peace can only be achieved by activating the social justice system, which has not happened to this day. Applying Galtung's concept of conflict to the characters of the play, it is mostly present in the behaviours and thoughts of the refugees and the American therapists, leading to tensions between them throughout the play. However, in the end, J.S. overcomes this through self-awareness and genuine empathy towards the women as real individuals with the same rights as herself, prioritising their interests and basic needs over her desire for success. In a heartfelt plea for social justice, she declares that the Bosnian refugees "need homes, a country, and care" (2001, p. 38). J.S. feels a sense of something that stands beyond the norms of her institution: the recognition of other's common humanity and the sensitivity of the humiliation and pain of others; it is human solidarity as explained by the American philosopher Richard Rorty, "our sense of solidarity is strongest when those with whom solidarity is expressed are thought of as 'one of us,' where 'us' means something smaller and more local than the human race" (Rorty, 1991, p. 191). While the lives of the refugees do not change materially or psychologically, J.S.'s life ultimately changes as she becomes part of them.

In conclusion, the Bosnian refugees are subjected to various forms of violence, according to Galtung's typology. In addition to Bosnian women being oppressed by the soldiers' coercive power, they have been objectified by the American state intellectuals. Their identity, reasoning, voice, and cultural thinking are buried as they are

E-ISSN: 2706-9931 P-ISSN: 1994-473X

intentionally misrepresented by ideological state apparatuses. Hence, violence is not limited to the refugees but also to all female characters of the play who perpetuate the cycle of pain, whether by harming themselves or harming others. Yet, the play conversely reveals that the cycle of violence is breakable through solidarity.

E-ISSN: 2706-9931 P-ISSN: 1994-473X

References

Ambesange, P. (2016). *Postcolonialism: Edward Said & Gayatri Spivak*. Research Journal of Recent Sciences. https://www.isca.me/rjrs/archive/v5/i8/9.ISCA-RJRS-2016-051.pdf

Bovard, K. (2002). [Review of the book Necessary Targets]. *Theatre Journal 54*(4), 642-643. https://doi.org/10.1353/tj.2002.0117

Campbell, R. (2009). *Campbell's Psychiatric Dictionary*. Oxford University Press.

Engels, F. (1972). *The Origin Of The Family, Private Property, And The State*. Pathfinder Press.

Ensler, E. (2007). I Still Don't Get How You Could Put a Leash on a Human Being. McKelvey (Ed.), *One of the Guys Women as Aggressors and Torturers*. Seal Press.

Ensler, E. (2012). *Eve Ensler on Being Raped*. Retrieved February 29, 2024, from https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1DW0UkMyJU4.

Ensler, E. (2001). *Necessary Targets*. Villard.

Eyers, P. (2022). Matriarchal Values: Our Pre-Colonial Heritage. *Deep Times and the Work That Reconnects*. https://journal.workthatreconnects.org/2022/03/24/matriarchal-values-our-pre-colonial-heritage/.

Finkel, M. (2017). *The Stranger in the Woods: The Extraordinary Story of the Last True Hermit*. Alfred A. Knopf.

Freud, S. (1963). *Jokes and Their Relation to the Unconscious* (J. Strackey, Trans.). Norton.

Galtung, J. (1990). Cultural Violence. *Journal of Peace Research*, *27*(3), 291–305. http://www.jstor.org/stable/423472

Galtung, J. (1996). *Peace By Peaceful Means: Peace and Conflict, Development and Civilization*. SAGE.

Galtung, J. (1969). Violence, Peace, and Peace Research. *Journal of Peace Research*, *6*(3), 167–191. http://www.jstor.org/stable/422690

Getlin, J. (1998). *Not the V word!*. Los Angeles Times. https://www.latimes.com/archives/la-xpm-1998-feb-11-ls-17706-story.html

Gilligan, J. (1997). *Violence: Reflections on a National Epidemic*. Vintage Books.

Hume, M. (2008). The Myths of Violence: Gender, Conflict, and Community in El Salvador. *Latin American Perspectives*, *35*(5), 59–76. http://www.jstor.org/stable/27648120.

Kesic, V. (2001). From Reverence to Rape: An Anthropology of Ethnic and Genderized Violence. In M. Waller & J. Rycenga (Eds.), *Frontline Feminisms: Women, War, and Resistance*. essay, Routledge.

Mambrol, N. (2019). *Analysis of Bertolt Brecht's Plays*. Literary Theory and Criticism. https://literariness.org/2019/05/04/analysis-of-bertolt-brechts-plays/

Maslow, A. H. (1970). *Motivation And Personality* (2nd ed). Harper & Row.

E-ISSN: 2706-9931 P-ISSN: 1994-473X

Mhayyal, B. M., & Al-Zubbaidi, H. (2022). Staging violence in Sarah Kane's Blasted & Ali Abdulnebi Al Ziadi's fourth generation: A comparative study. *INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF RESEARCH IN SOCIAL SCIENCES & HUMANITIES*, *12*(04), 633–645. https://doi.org/10.37648/ijrssh.v12i04.033

Morales, M. (2005). Communicating the Experience of War. The 'Us vs. Them' Dialectic in Eve Ensler's 'Necessary Targets'. *English Studies*. 25.

Nasser, A. A. H. (2006). *The Literary Significance of Music, Songs, and Dancing in Modern Poetic Tragedies: A Study of Selected Plays by W.B. Yeats& W.H. Auden* (thesis).

Rabani, S. T., Khan, Q. R., & Khanday, A. M. (2020). Detection of Suicidal Ideation on Twitter using Machine Learning & Ensemble Approaches. *Baghdad Science Journal*, *17*(4), 1328–1339. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.21123/bsj.2020.17.4.1328.

Rorty, R. (1991). *Contingency, irony, and solidarity* . Cambridge University Press.

Smith, N. B., Kouros, C. D., & Meuret, A. E. (2014). The Role of Trauma Symptoms in Nonsuicidal Self-Injury. Trauma, Violence & Abuse, 15(1), 41–56. https://www.jstor.org/stable/26638332.

Spivak, G. (1994). Can the Subaltern Speak? In P. Williams & L. Chrisman (Eds.), *Colonial Discourse And Post-Colonial Theory: A Reader*. essay, Columbia University Press.

Toft, M. (Ed.). (2013). *Drama Criticism* (Vol. 47). Gale.

Turpin , J. (1998). Many Faces: Women Confronting War. In L. Lorentzen & J. Turpin (Eds.), *The Women and War Reader*. essay, New York UP.

E-ISSN: 2706-9931 P-ISSN: 1994-473X

العنف واللاجئات: دراسة في مسرحية أهداف ضرورية لإيف إنسلر

غدير عادل عباس
د. علياء عبد الحسين ناصر
جامعة بغداد – كلية الآداب

الملخص:

توضح مسرحية إيف إنسلر أهداف ضرورية (1996) أهمية فهم العنف في البوسنة في سياق العنف المعرفي الذي تمارسه الأجهزة الإيديولوجية للقوى الغربية. تشير المسرحية إلى أن نظام المعرفة المهيمن يصور اللاجئات البوسنيات على أنهن بدائيات لغرض قمع اصواتهن وإدامة تفوق الغرب. باستخدام تصنيف يوهان غالتونغ للعنف، يبحث هذا المقال في أشكال العنف الذي تتعرض له اللاجئات في البوسنة. يقدم غالتونغ ثلاثة أنواع من العنف: العنف المباشر، العنف البنيوي، والعنف الثقافي. كما يسلط المقال الضوء على مفهوم العنف كدائرة ذاتية الاستدامة من أجل استكشاف إمكانية كسرها.